

Reviews (Books)

Alexievich, Svetlana.

Last Witnesses: An Oral History of the Children of World War II.

New York: Random House, 2019. 320 pages. ISBN: 9780399588754.

“June 1941 ... I remember it. I was very little, but I remember everything.” (3) The book’s opening line is a perfect summary of the entire work. *Last Witnesses: An Oral History of the Children of World War II* is an account of young children who had firsthand experiences during World War II. These oral histories collected by Svetlana Alexievich come from children who were four to fourteen years old at the time, with one account from a child who was two and one from a child who was three. For some children, it is nearly impossible to tell where they lived during the war because their account provides no specific regions or places to help situate their account. Other children mention where they grew up and lived, which tells us from which theater of war they came. The most frequently mentioned city is Minsk, which would situate those children in the heart of Operation Barbarossa, the Germans’ push into the Soviet Union. The author (or, rather, editor) of *Last Witnesses*, Svetlana Alexievich, has spent much her life in the Soviet Union and Belarus, but was eventually exiled to western Europe. Alexievich is an investigative journalist, an essayist, and an oral historian. She worked at numerous newspapers before earning her degree from the Belarusian State University. Through her work as a journalist, Alexievich developed a nonfiction genre that uses oral history to bring to life specific moments in history. She has covered the Chernobyl nuclear accident (1986), the fall of the Soviet Union (1991), and the War in Afghanistan (2001-present). Her outstanding writing abilities earned her the 2015 Nobel Prize in Literature, and she is the first writer from Belarus to ever win this prestigious award.

Last Witnesses is not at all what one would expect after reading the publisher’s description. It is not a work that uses oral histories to document a historical narrative; rather, it presents the oral histories of around one hundred people who were children during World War II to show a different side of the war. Alexievich lets these interviews stand on their own, as a quasi-supplement to the history of the war. Instead of chapters with common themes, readers encounter one hundred stories, organized by the names of the individuals who provided their oral histories and labeled by pertinent quotes from these oral histories. Alexievich provides the age of the children at the time they had their experiences in World War II, as well as their occupations at the time they were being interviewed. Some oral histories are only a page or two long, while others extend over multiple pages.

There are three central themes that these oral histories bring to light: the theme of pure anguish and horror due to bombings and the like; the theme of fantasy and mystery used by these children to cope with reality; and the theme of

hope that, no matter what they went through, it could have always been worse. The book's overarching topic is the horror and devastation that these children had to go through. They recount stories of starvation, bombings, murders, and abandonment as if these were nothing more than everyday occurrences. Readers can feel how much pain it caused these children to have to live with insufficient nourishment. Being under the constant threat of warfare was a daily reality some of these children had to face. Some children even recount having to watch their parents and other relatives being shot dead in front of them. One child tells the story of how he became numb enough from the war to kill a German. He describes how he watched his grandfather be shot, then later his grandmother, and how he watched his mother be beat in the head to the point that she was bleeding through her hair. To him, it was just a part of the war, and it did not bother him at the time, but later it began to haunt him in his dreams. (278)

It is sobering and fascinating to learn how some children's inability to cope with reality led them to alternative ways to deal with their wartime experiences. Because of the innocence of their minds, they turned to things that they knew, such as fairy tales and fantasy. Polia Pashkevich recounts her experience with the war as a four-year-old. (141-143) She pictured the war as taking place in a big black forest because that is where bad things happen in fairy tales. Children discuss the sense of abandonment they felt when their parents died or left them at orphanages where parents believed their children would have better chances of survival. One element that is really touching through the horror stories is the fact that these young children faced interrogation to get information on their parents or for their own actions. One child recounts the tale of being interrogated for collecting weapons from a field, when he was merely trying to provide for his family by collecting the last of the frozen potatoes. (121-122) Another child recounts the fear that she felt knowing that that Soviets were closing in on their location, that they would capture and interrogate her, and that she would not have the strength to survive the interrogation. (290)

Yet, in all the horror stories that these children tell, there are nonetheless some that recognize beauty in the midst of war. One girl tells the story of turning to books that had pretty pictures as a way to pass time and distract herself from what was happening around her. (151) There is one account that is particularly striking in this respect. Katya Korotaeva recounts her experience with the war and surviving the Minsk bombing. (10-13) After the bombings, she still noticed how beautiful and bountiful the lilacs and bird-cherry blooms were that year. Something that is especially noteworthy about the oral histories collected in *Last Witnesses* is the vivid nature of the stories that these people were able to recount from their childhood. There are those who are able to remember the smells or scents of a particular moment. There are those who remember harnessing up a cow to go and bring their mother's body home because they did not have a horse. (185) There are those who are able to remember almost every detail about a specific event. For some, remembering every little detail is a way to help them

deal with the events, while others find themselves trapped in the little details of the stories they are telling.

That Alexievich provides the occupations of the narrators at the time they were being interviewed is an interesting editorial decision. It shows that not only did these people experience something horrible when they were little, but they were able to put these situations behind them and make a life for themselves. They did not let these bad situations define them, but, instead, chose to thrive and move on with their lives. *Last Witnesses* would have benefitted from Alexievich addressing the methodology behind her book. There is no preface or introduction that explains the way the book is constructed. However, many readers will want to know how she found her subjects, how she approached them, how she dealt with drafting her questions, how she addressed the aged memory of these individuals, and how she processed her interviews after they had been conducted. Every person has a different approach, so Alexievich acknowledging the method behind her process would have strengthened her book. *Last Witnesses* also could have used an introduction that would have addressed the themes that these children are recounting in order to place their stories into a larger historical context. That said, the way in which Alexievich allows these stories to stand on their own shows just how impactful they truly are. There is no need for much historical grounding to have these stories resonate deeply with their readers. These stories are so powerful that they deserve to be brought to life in a way that enhances their true meaning. These are not just stories to help substantiate the historical record, rather, they are stories that shape the historical record. Alexievich does use footnotes, but these primarily serve to provide clarification rather than citing sources.

It does need to be said that this book deals with deeply personal and sometimes disturbing subject matters as these children recount their stories, and the fact that these stories come from the memories of children makes this subject matter even more intense. While adults experienced just as much and, in some cases, more during World War II, to hear how such young and innocent children were so dramatically affected is extremely depressing. These were innocent lives that did not deserve to have to go through what they had to go through. Reading the accounts of the two-year-old and the three-year-old, as well as those of the four-year-olds, is especially harrowing. That these people were able to remember things that happened to them at such a young age really shows how dramatic an impact these events made in their lives. *Last Witnesses* is highly recommended to all those who can handle reading about difficult and sometimes deeply disturbing situations. The book is expertly translated and paints a picture through the lens of innocent eyes and ears about what life was truly like for children during World War II. Historians reading this book will find their knowledge of the wartime experience profoundly enhanced. If one is interested in more books on the oral histories of World War II, *The Good War: An Oral History of World War II* by Studs Terkel is an excellent place to turn to. It uses the

oral histories of a variety of individuals to bring to life other perspectives of World War II just like *Last Witnesses* does.

ABOUT THE REVIEWER: Sierra Rey Sampson of West Covina, California, earned her B.A. in History (2017) and her M.A. in History (2020) at California State University, Fullerton (CSUF), where she is a member of the Theta-Pi Chapter of Phi Alpha Theta (History Honor Society). She served as an editor for Volume 46 (2019) of "The Welebaethan: A Journal of History."

Biggs, Thomas, and Jessica Blum, eds.
The Epic Journey in Greek and Roman Literature.

Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2019. 336 pages. ISBN: 9781108498098.

"Speak, Memory / Of the cunning hero, / The wanderer, blown off course time and again / After he plundered Troy's sacred heights." (Homer, *Odyssey*) Homer's *Odyssey* laid the foundations for epic journeys, harkening back to an age of heroes, allowing readers to traverse real and imaginary worlds. These epic journeys were an integral part of classical literature. On closer evaluation, common themes can be found throughout these works, like the concepts of home, the role of gender and identity, and the limits of time and space. *The Epic Journey in Greek and Roman Literature*, edited by Thomas Biggs and Jessica Blum, contains a series of essays which are the result of a yearlong colloquium, "Home and Away: The Epic Journey," held at Yale University in 2014. These essays attempt to reimagine the epic journey from various genres and historical contexts, forming a cohesive collection in the process.

Thomas Biggs, an associate professor of Classics at the University of Georgia, and Jessica Blum, an associate professor of Classical Studies at the University of San Francisco, divided this collection into four parts. Each part corresponds to a theme covered by the contributing scholars who analyze the works of ancient writers such as Homer, Virgil, Lucian, Apollonius of Rhodes, Heliodorus, and Valerius Flaccus. Part I focuses on Homer's *Odyssey*, looking at the themes of *nostos* (homecoming) and *pompē* (conveyance) that are prevalent in the work. Part II develops the idea of home and its relationship to the heroes of ancient Greece. Part III establishes the role the epic journey plays in the construction of national identity. And Part IV examines the role of space in the cosmic scheme which helped writers define distance in the Roman Empire.

Part I begins with the journey of Odysseus and his homeward voyage to Ithaca. Its three essays focus on the concept of homecoming, *nostos*, and how the journey, as a process, helped to shape the heroes and the world around them. The first essay, "In and Out of the Golden Age: A Hesiodic Reading of the *Odyssey*," written by Egbert Bakker, a Dutch classical scholar and professor at Yale University, applies literary analysis to Homer's *Odyssey* and Hesiod's *Works and Days*, as well as archaeological and paleo-botanical data. Bakker masterfully interprets Odysseus's journey home as he travels through the transitional stages of man, beginning with the Golden Age in Troy and ending in the Iron Age as he

makes landfall near his home on Ithaca. The second essay, “*Pompē* in the *Odyssey*” by Alexander C. Loney, a scholar of Greek literature, focuses on the modes of conveyance used by Odysseus on his journey home. In analyzing Homer’s *Odyssey* and the works of Homeric scholars, Loney interprets *pompē* (conveyance) as being neither an active nor a passive mode, but highly reliant on cooperation, trust, and promise-keeping. (31) Jessica Blum’s essay, “‘What Country, Friends, is This?’ Geography and Exemplary in Valerius Flaccus’ *Argonautica*,” is the final essay in Part I of this collection. The essay’s title is deceptive, though, as Blum analyzes the *Argonautica* as a martial epic based on the Homeric ideal of *nostos* and Roman *virtus* (virtue). According to Blum, the *Argonautica* is a tale in which the heroes can never achieve their sought-after *nostos*, as they traverse the ever-changing landscape that eventually destabilizes their chosen *exempla*.

Part II attempts to answer the question how gender impacts the perception of the journey and the meaning of home and away. Classicist Silvia Montiglio’s essay, “Wandering, Love, and Home in Apollonius of Rhodes’ *Argonautica* and Heliodorus’ *Aethiopica*” follows the tales of Jason and Chariclea, and discusses the meaning of home and love in terms of belonging and homelessness. (91) Montiglio contrasts Jason’s journey experience with that of Medea, who severed ties with her home and accompanied a man who could never give her that feeling of belonging that she longed for. Medea embodies the tragic heroine who finds herself without a home to return to. This feeling of homelessness is not shared by Chariclea in Heliodorus’s *Aethiopica*, who can be seen as the exemplary woman of Greek literature for successfully completing an epic journey. Montiglio sees Chariclea’s journey as a reflection of a major shift in gender roles, as women found themselves able to travel more freely in the real world. (107) Classics professor Emily Baragwanath’s essay, “Heroes and Homemakers in Xenophon,” examines Xenophon’s *Anabasis*, a work that chronicles the author’s journey from Asia Minor and his return home. (108) When compared to Homer’s *Odyssey*, Xenophon appears to concern himself with memory and the attainment of *kleos* (glory/renown). However, Baragwanath takes a different approach and analyzes the work as a “tale of achieving *nostos*” since Xenophon attempts to secure the survival and salvation of his men by establishing relationships, forging unity and harmony, and creating a sense of home despite being on a journey. (111) In order to understand Xenophon’s view of home, Baragwanath conceptualizes home as more symbolic than physical, namely, as something tied to the relationships, identities, and values that Xenophon and his men hold on to. In this view, women play a key role in the survival of men, acting as conduits of power, which is similar to the function of Homer’s Penelope. The third and final essay in Part II, “Women’s Travels in the *Aeneid*,” comes from Alison Keith, a professor of Classics at the University of Toronto. Using literary analysis, Keith attempts to compare the male hero and the female hero in terms of their mobility in the epic genre. She focuses on the travel experiences of Dido, Andromache, and the

Trojan women in the *Aeneid*. Beginning with Dido, Keith compares her journey to that of Aeneas, whose journey was necessitated by Dido's attempts to escape from her tyrannical brother Pygmalion. The fall of Troy led many women into slavery, often experiencing violence and sexual exploitation. Andromache echoes this sentiment, offering a look at the sexual violence that many displaced women had to face. (139) In contrast, the surviving Trojan women represented unenthusiastic travelers whose main duty throughout was to bear public witness to the destruction of their city of Troy. (140) Keith believes that the *Aeneid* had the potential to fully allow women to participate in the epic tale, but that it falls short of such expectations and helps to perpetuate the genre's male-centeredness.

Part III sees the epic journey as a catalyst for the creation of national identity as the scholars attempt to define Rome's place in the wider world. "Epic Journeys on an Urban Scale: Movement and Travel in Vergil's *Aeneid*," an essay by Timothy M. O'Sullivan, professor of Classical Studies at Trinity University, establishes that Vergil saw the symbolism behind the acts of movement in his work. O'Sullivan explores the idea that movement in the *Aeneid* is a physical representation "of the tension between destructive and constructive forces." (152) He believes that this dichotomy between order and chaos, destruction and restoration, is a metaphor for the transformation that Rome was experiencing under Augustus. Thomas Biggs's essay, "Roman and Carthaginian Journeys: Punic *Pietas* in Naevius' *Bellum Punicum* and Plautus' *Poenulus*," shows how Aeneas's *pietas* was influenced by early literary works of the Roman Republic. Biggs chronicles the evolution of the definition of *pietas* as readers understand it in Vergil's *Aeneid*. The concept of *pietas* was embodied by protagonists Dido, whose journey and death transformed her into a martyr-like character, and Hanno in Plautus's *Poenulus*, whose fatherly devotion was seen in his search for his daughter. "Defining Home, Defining Rome: Germanicus' Eastern Tour," an essay by Cynthia Damon and Elizabeth Palazzolo, both professors of Classics, follows the itinerary of Germanicus as told in Tacitus's *Annals*. Using epigraphic and numismatic evidence from Greece and Asia Minor, Damon and Palazzolo piece together Germanicus's eastward journey and fill in the gaps found in Tacitus's work. They recreate Germanicus's journey to the far reaches of the Roman Empire, discovering along the way that it was full of reminders of home, a home to which he could not return. The final essay in Part III comes from Classicist Andrew C. Johnston, "Odyssean Wanderings and Greek Responses to Roman Empire," and returns to Homer's *Odyssey* and its legacy in the Roman Empire. Johnston uses the works of Greek intellectuals such as Dio of Prusa, Aelius Aristides, Lucian of Samosata, and the Emperor Julian to elaborate on the themes of time, space, and power in the Roman world's perception of Odysseus.

Part IV takes readers to the limits of time and space. Through literary analysis, assistant professor of Classics Martin Devecka's essay, "From Rome to the Moon: Rutilius Namatianus and the Late Antique Game of Knowledge," studies Rutilius Namatianus's poem *De reditu suo*. This work, which Devecka

believes should be considered a “classical travel poem,” takes readers on a journey from Rome to the moon, alluding to Rutilius’s study of the tides as an integral part of his travels. (244) The last essay comes from ancient historian Karen ní Mheallaigh, “Looking Back in Wonder: Contemplating Home from the *Illiad* to *Pale Blue Dot*.” Mheallaigh analyzes Lucian’s *Icaromenippus* which allows her to construct the motif of *gaiaskopia* as readers follow Menippus’s journey to the moon and gain a different perspective of Earth. Studying ancient sources and modern photos of the Earth from space influences the way our planet is viewed from afar and allows readers to change their concept of home. (264)

There are scholarly works that have already tackled the epic journey, such as Don Nardo’s *Quests and Journeys: Discovering Mythology* (2001) and Richard Jenkyns’s *Classical Literature: An Epic Journey from Homer to Virgil and Beyond* (2015). Although these volumes are great introductions to the epic journey, they leave readers wanting more. Biggs’s and Blum’s collection, *The Epic Journey in Greek and Roman Literature*, fills that void and is highly recommended reading.

ABOUT THE REVIEWER: Clarisse Anne Delima of Long Beach, California, earned her B.S.N. at California State University, Long Beach (CSULB) (2008), where she graduated “cum laude.” She is currently pursuing an M.A. in History at CSUF, working on comprehensive examinations on the Crusades and Ancient Greek warfare. She is working as a school nurse in the Los Angeles Unified School District.

Blight, David W.

Frederick Douglass: Prophet of Freedom.

New York: Simon & Schuster, 2018. 912 pages. ISBN: 9781416590316.

Frederick Douglass (1818-1895) wrote some of the most revered autobiographical works in the American literary canon. His first, *Narrative of the Life of Frederick Douglass, an American Slave* (1845), remains a staple of the American history curriculum, both domestically and abroad. Yale Historian David W. Blight suggests the story of the escaped slave has universal appeal “for all who wish to escape outward or inward captivity.” (xix) Douglass’s works play a wide range of roles in American public life, from primary sources illustrative of America’s brutal slave-driven past to instructive materials in rhetorical composition. Given the enduring power of Douglass’s own words, one may question the value of an outsider’s perspective on the slave-turned-statesman. Blight seems to validate this question at least in some sections of his ambitious biography, *Frederick Douglass: Prophet of Freedom*, namely, whenever he merely provides context for Douglass’s words to speak for themselves. Like other great writers, however, Douglass crafted a public persona with his many words. It is the development of Douglass, the fallible human behind the mighty works, that is the focus of Blight’s new volume.

While there has been a myriad of academic works on specific aspects of Douglass’s life, there have been relatively few full biographies. Benjamin Quarles’s 1948 work *Frederick Douglass* was long considered the most

comprehensive. Dickson Preston's *Young Frederick Douglass* (1980) and Leigh Fought's *Women in the World of Frederick* (2007) provided new information about certain aspects of Douglass's life. According to Blight, a longtime editor of Douglass's works, the immediate impetus for his new book was his encounter with a private collection of Douglass material owned by Walter O. Evans of Savannah, Georgia. This material revealed previously unknown facts about the final third of Douglass's life. (xvi) The Douglass who advised presidents, served as ambassador, and defended the post-Civil War Amendments of the United States Constitution is indeed less remembered than the earlier Douglass, the largely self-taught slave who resisted the blows of the slave breaker and escaped to freedom. In this volume, Blight sheds light on this controversial but essential later period in Douglass's life.

That said, *Frederick Douglass, Prophet of Freedom* is an examination of the whole of Douglass's life through different lenses. In his introduction, Blight presents several themes. The first is a study of the development of Douglass's "voice," his prodigious facility with language that served as his greatest weapon against slavery. The second is a critical analysis of Douglass's own autobiographies. Blight, who helped pioneer the study of American historical memory in his 2001 monograph, *Race and Reunion: The Civil War in American Memory*, argues here that to remember is also to invent. (xvii) He asserts that Douglass used his mastery of language to invent his public persona. What Douglass chose not to include is as important as what he chose to include. For example, Douglass neglected to write much about his personal life, the discussion of which is a third theme of the book. He married twice, first a free-born black woman, Anna Murray, and later, in the final decade of his life, a younger white woman, Helen Pitts. A fourth theme, which incidentally provides the title of the book, is Douglass's role as a prophet in the fiery tradition of Old Testament prophets. It seeks to examine how Douglass applied the harsh rhetoric of the King James Bible to the contemporary context of American slavery, and doing the same with biblical imagery of redemption following the Civil War. A fifth theme is Douglass's transition from a radical outsider in the 1840s and 1850s to a powerful political insider from the 1860s onward. Blight examines how Douglass found a balance of strongly criticizing the institutions of the United States while eventually working within the system. Finally, Blight examines the development of Douglass as an intellectual whose political philosophy evolved with the changing circumstances of African Americans in the United States. (xvii-xx)

The themes are as penetrating as the story is captivating. Given the focus on new materials, only the book's first 80 pages or so recount the material that comprises Douglass's *Narrative of the Life* and *My Bondage and My Freedom*. Douglass was born Frederick Bailey in Maryland in February of 1818 to Harriet Baily, a slave of Aaron Anthony who oversaw the Wye Plantation of Edward Lloyd. At the age of six, he was permanently separated from his mother and grandmother when he was moved to the Wye Plantation, an experience he

described as one of brutal contradictions. There he witnessed the first of many acts of physical violence against slave women that would haunt his memory. He personally avoided the worst of slavery, as he was moved to Baltimore at the age of eight to serve as a childhood companion and attendant of the young Tommy Auld, one of Aaron Anthony's relatives. There his literary impulses were awakened by Sophia Auld, his master's wife, who provided him with his first reading lessons. This benevolent treatment was quickly suppressed, but the fire had been ignited: the young Douglass continued to develop his literacy with whatever resources were available to him. The first book he purchased, a textbook on rhetoric called *The Columbian Orator*, had an early influence on his public voice, which he further cultivated by holding Sunday School classes for fellow slaves. Despite these advantages, the weight of bondage pressed upon his psyche. His defiant spirit prompted his master, Thomas Auld, to rent him out to the brutal slave-breaker Edward Covey. Covey's abuse caused Douglass to physically resist this oppression in an experience he described as his assertion of equality. He failed in his first try to escape slavery before succeeding in his second attempt. (8-86)

Douglass then worked as a laborer in New Bedford, Massachusetts, for three years, and during this time he encountered William Lloyd Garrison's magazine *The Liberator* which familiarized him with the abolitionist movement. He spoke at an abolitionist convention attended by Garrison himself who adopted him as a protégé and recruited him to join the abolitionist speaking circuit. Douglass initially embraced the idealistic Garrisonian doctrine of disunionism and became a popular speaker, using his experience as a slave as his primary rhetorical device. This success prompted him to write his famous *Narrative of the Life*, the publication of which necessitated a trip to the British Isles to evade recapture. His celebrity grew, and soon after returning to the United States he became sufficiently confident to break off from Garrison and start his own newspaper, *The North Star*. During the 1850s, Douglass embraced a more active approach to abolitionism, engaging in the political debates he had previously spurned and covertly supporting the radical abolitionist John Brown.

From the onset of the Civil War, Douglass saw the conflict as an opportunity for a revolutionary overthrow of slavery while most Northern observers, in the early stages, were still calling for a limited conflict. He vehemently criticized the Lincoln administration for what he deemed to be inactivity before embracing its policy of abolition. Blight identifies Southern secession as the moment of political transformation for Douglass. Rather than as a purely evil entity, Douglass now identified the United States as a good republic that had been held captive by slave power. He vehemently dismissed popular schemes of colonization, professing a belief in racial equality and a "brotherhood of man." This transformation was completed with Lincoln's issuing of the preliminary Emancipation Proclamation in September of 1862. The newly nationalistic Douglass, who a decade earlier had decried the hypocrisy of Americans

celebrating liberty on the Fourth of July, now proclaimed “liberty and country first.” The struggle to build a new republic based on the principles of political equality would occupy the remainder of Douglass’s life. (355-384)

Blight argues that the voice of Frederick Douglass is relevant to twenty-first-century political debates. He points to Douglass’s 1860 editorial for the elimination of a poll tax in New York state as having a passage that would fit perfectly into “an early twenty-first-century American debate over voter suppression measures.” (325-326) Douglass’s prolific output makes it so that it is often best to let him speak for himself in political matters. An autumn 1862 exchange of open letters between Douglass and Postmaster General Montgomery Blair, an advocate of colonization, is an example of Blight simply allowing Douglass’s rhetorical brilliance to shine. In other passages, Blight is more critical of the polemicist, noting his tone deafness when calling Unionist sentiment feckless in the wake of enormous casualties at the 1862 Battle of Shiloh. (334-355)

While revering Douglass the abolitionist hero, Blight does not shy away from the human qualities of Douglass’s character. Through the writings of Richard Webb, one of Douglass’s Irish benefactors, Douglass is shown to have been excessively sensitive to real or imagined slights. (142-143) He was protective of his preeminence among abolitionists. Blight presents Douglass’s advocacy for merciless bloodshed upon the commencement of the secession crisis as an extension of his desire for personal vengeance on his former slaveholders. Blight also portrays Douglass’s relationship with his first wife Anna in a critical light, noting that Douglass probably had romantic relationships with two European women while he was married, namely, the British Julia Hull and the German Ollie Assing. (xix) These women served as emotional and intellectual companions to Douglass, presumably much to Anna’s dismay. Assing was openly hostile to her hostess, and Blight notes that Douglass “enabled the intruder.” (338-339) Non-academic readers may find Blight’s inclination to interpret Douglass’s actions, rather than simply present them, overbearing. In most cases, however, Blight demonstrates reasonable restraint.

Ever since Douglass’s death, his legacy has been appropriated by adherents of nearly every political opinion. (755-764) Blight points to Douglass’s adoption by the modern Republican Party as an example of his symbolic malleability. (xvi) While refraining from explicitly defining Douglass’s successors in contemporary politics, Blight concludes by offering a simple summation of Douglass’s thought: that through his voice he expressed a longing for freedom. Freedom, a word with limitless possibilities, remains the defining concept of the American ethos. This detailed examination of the concept through the complicated life of one of the country’s greatest figures should be of interest to any reader.

ABOUT THE REVIEWER: Timothy Joseph Mancillas of Whittier, California, earned his B.A. in History with an emphasis on the Americas and Africa at the University of California, Santa Cruz (2017). He is currently pursuing an M.A in history at California State University, Fullerton (CSUF).

Boyd, Andrew.

The Royal Navy in Eastern Waters: Linchpin of Victory 1935-1942.

Barnsley: Seaforth Publishing, 2017. 496 pages. ISBN: 9781473892484.

In the years preceding World War II, the British Royal Navy reigned supreme as the world's most powerful naval force. It had a considerable array of ships at its disposal that outnumbered rival navies like the German Kriegsmarine or the Imperial Japanese Navy. The Royal Navy maintained a large number of ships, and its superiority after World War I as a strong navy was essential for the protection of the British Empire and other strategic interests. Among these interests were Britain's colonies in East Asia and the Pacific from India to Singapore. While the Battle of the Atlantic was crucial to the survival of Britain and a major success for the Royal Navy during World War II, Britain's efforts in Asia and the Pacific were also a priority for the Royal Navy. The latter is the main argument of naval historian Andrew Boyd's book *The Royal Navy in Eastern Waters: Linchpin of Victory 1935-1942*. Boyd is a senior research fellow at the University of Buckingham, England, specializing in twentieth-century naval history. His education at Britannia Royal Naval College, Dartmouth, and St. John's College, Oxford, combined with a career in the Royal Navy, has provided him with unique insight and skills to write about British naval history. In this monograph, Boyd examines the Royal Navy in detail with regard to its strength and its strategies for protecting the Empire, specifically against Japan in East Asia and the Pacific, supplementing the works of other British naval historians like David Hobbs's book, *The British Pacific Fleet: The Royal Navy's Most Powerful Strike Force* (2011). Boyd discusses the strategic agreements between Britain and the United States of America, as well as the Royal Navy's assessment of the Japanese Navy and the disastrous campaigns of the early years of the Pacific War. His book, while lengthy (496 pages), is effective in making the argument that World War II's Pacific theater was a great priority for the Royal Navy and crucial for victory over the Axis and for the preservation of the British Empire.

Any discussion of the Royal Navy's successes and failures must begin with an assessment of its actual strength, and in the case of Boyd's work this means the Royal Navy's ability to defend the British Empire in the Far East. This is done effectively in the book's eight chapters, separated into four different parts. These chapters and parts follow a chronological order from 1935 to 1942. The chapters cover the Royal Navy's preparations for war, the outbreak of war, and the priorities of the Royal Navy based on alliances and economic interest of the British Empire. They also discuss the challenges faced by the Royal Navy both before and during the war, and the string of events that led to disaster in the Pacific in the early months of fighting the Japanese Empire. What readers can expect to come away with is a better understanding of how a series of pre-war limitations, continuous shifts in wartime scenarios, and economic priorities led to near disaster against the Japanese. However, despite such limitations and

challenges, the Royal Navy was still able to maintain a presence in the Far East to secure victory. According to Boyd, “despite limitations imposed by the Washington Naval Treaty, the Royal Navy remained the largest and most powerful navy with the largest force of warships.” (8) Thus, it is important to consider the Royal Navy’s strength in warships, in addition to its weaknesses, when compared to other navies, particularly the Japanese Navy. According to Boyd, “the Royal Navy was well aware of the threat of Japanese modernization of its navy with a focus on long-range combat.” (38)

Yet what also needs to be assessed is the Royal Navy’s and the Japanese Navy’s respective airpower at sea. As seen with the attack on Pearl Harbor, the destruction of the British naval squadron “Force Z,” and the raid on Ceylon (Sri Lanka), carrier and land-based air power was at the core of naval engagements in the Pacific theater of World War II. Boyd notes that the Royal Navy lacked air power in the Far East. In 1939, “only one of a planned fleet of eight aircraft carriers,” namely, H.M.S. (His Majesty’s Ship) *Ark Royal*, was completed, while four additional ones, H.M.S. *Illustrious*, *Formidable*, *Victorious*, and *Indomitable*, would be “commissioned over the next two years.” (44) At the time of hostilities, the British only had a light carrier, H.M.S. *Hermes*, stationed in the Far East, leaving the Royal Navy outmatched by the Japanese Navy. Boyd does a clever job of pointing out that the British should have recognized the future of air power and taken note of Japanese aircraft advances. However, due to “poor procurement of air resources,” traditionalist admirals favoring the big gun battleships, and competition with the Royal Air Force for planes, the Royal Navy was outmatched and ill-prepared to face the Japanese in naval air combat. (45-48) Nevertheless, recognizing that there was a significant threat from Japanese imperial ambitions, the British Admiralty was forced to prepare for war and prioritize its goals in the Far East.

The ability to protect British interests in the eastern parts of the Empire was put to the test and strained with the outbreak of war. Boyd effectively points out that, in case of war with Japan, defense was the Royal Navy’s main strategy. He argues that the defense of Singapore was the Royal Navy’s priority, in addition to the defense of India and Ceylon. While one would think that the Royal Navy’s efforts were focused on aircraft carriers, Boyd stresses that the Admiralty played with the idea of a classic fleet action, during which they would deploy the *Queen Elizabeth*-class and R-class battleships as part of the defensive strategy. The use of numerous big-gun battleships would have been feasible for “classic” fleet engagements, but modern naval warfare was drifting away from such tactics. Things were complicated further by the outbreak of war with Germany in 1939.

The war in Europe put severe pressure on the British Admiralty who was now forced to prioritize its strategy to combat the navies of the Axis powers. Boyd notes that this was particularly felt after the fall of France in 1940. The British strategy against Germany and Italy relied on the French Navy, which had to be neutralized once France had fallen to the Nazis. This meant that the Royal

Navy had to deploy additional forces to the Mediterranean Sea, which limited the availability of warships for the Far East. The fall of France and the Royal Navy's new efforts in the Mediterranean Sea forced the Royal Navy to turn to the United States Navy for assistance in East Asia.

Once hostilities in the Pacific had begun, the Royal Navy found itself ill-prepared for engagements with the Japanese Navy. Being overstretched in the European theater meant that the Royal Navy had to turn to its alliance with the United States to balance the situation in the East. However, the attack on Pearl Harbor weakened the United States Navy in the Pacific, which meant that, as far as British possessions in the region were concerned, Britain was left vulnerable. The attack also signaled that the war in the Pacific would not be fought from the big guns of battleships but by carrier-based aircraft. Boyd's monograph makes a great case that the Royal Navy was not just lacking aircraft carriers, it lacked resources for naval air warfare due to its competition with the Royal Air Force for resources, which ultimately brought about the failure of the Royal Navy's defense of British possessions in the Pacific theater of war.

The British underestimating of Japan's capabilities, and the multitude of fronts on which the Royal Navy found itself fighting, led to disaster in eastern waters. The sinking of H.M.S. *Prince of Wales* and H.M.S. *Repulse* three days after the Japanese attack on Pearl Harbor paved the way for the fall of Singapore and future Japanese aggression. This loss struck a blow to British morale and triggered a strategic response from the Admiralty, as Boyd points out, in an argument supplementing the work of Martin Middlebrook and Patrick Mahoney in *The Sinking of the Prince of Wales and Repulse the End of the Battleship Era* (1977). The strategy was changed to protect the Indian Ocean by "deploying H.M.S. *Revenge* from Cape Town, South Africa, and the rest of the R-class battleships in addition to the aircraft carrier H.M.S. *Hermes* to the Indian Ocean and Ceylon to counter Japanese aggression." (341) Boyd notes that the Royal Navy continued to struggle with competing priorities in the Mediterranean Sea and in the Middle East in order to protect its vital interests there and was almost entirely ineffective against the Japanese Navy. This ineffectiveness was proven during the Japanese aircraft carrier raid on Ceylon (Chapter 8), which Boyd discusses in detail, particularly the deployment of ships by both the British and Japanese navies in an effort to counter each other's actions. The lack of British air power led to the loss of H.M.S. *Hermes* and several smaller ships. The losses at Ceylon caused a redeployment of the Royal Navy's eastern squadron and led to a scramble to secure the Middle East and India.

Boyd emphasizes that, after the raid on Ceylon, the Royal Navy considered strengthening its forces in the Pacific, but this was set aside once the strength of the United States Navy was brought to bear. Even with the arrival of the more modern capital ships, the British remained on the defensive to protect their interests in the Middle East and India. Boyd points out that British intelligence reassessed the Japanese naval strength once the full might of the U.S. Navy came

into play, and this resulted in the Admiralty concluding that the eastern theater of war should remain a defensive campaign. This strategy of defense in East Asia allowed Britain to hold the line against the Japanese and go on the offensive against Germany. It also allowed the Royal Navy to secure the Mediterranean Sea for the North Africa campaign and turn the tide against the German U-boats in the Atlantic.

In concluding his work, Boyd restates his argument that British efforts in the East were ultimately about prioritizing the economic interests of the Empire. He first assesses the Royal Navy's overall strength in addition to its initial strategy for defense in the Far East, and he then reevaluates the situation as the war progresses. Boyd skillfully compares the strengths of both rival and Allied navies, and he stresses that Britain's strategy was dependent on its alliances with France and the United States. Boyd's work considers strategy, naval strength, and prioritization of interests. *The Royal Navy in Eastern Waters* discusses the Royal Navy's pre-World War II strength and strategy effectively, and it shows how the events in Europe shaped the Royal Navy's efforts in the East. For those seeking to learn more about the Royal Navy, both before and during World War II, as well as its Pacific campaigns, this book is a good starting point.

ABOUT THE REVIEWER: *Michael James Thomas of Laguna Beach, California, earned his A.A. in Humanities and Languages at Irvine Valley College in Irvine, California (2010), and his B.A. in History at California State University, Fullerton (CSUF) (2012). He is currently pursuing an M.A in History at CSUF, focusing on British naval history. He is a member of CSUF's Theta-Pi Chapter of Phi Alpha Theta (History Honor Society) and serves as one of its board members-at-large.*

Ellis, Joseph J.

American Dialogue: The Founders and Us.

New York: Alfred A. Knopf, 2018. 304 pages. ISBN: 9780385353427.

Joseph Ellis's *American Dialogue: The Founders and Us* is a book about dialogues, as its title suggests, but not necessarily the kind of dialogues one might first imagine. The premise, a historical duality between past and present, between the founding era and today, is merely a stage for the great play that Ellis seeks to bring to the theater of the mind. He uses Thomas Jefferson, John Adams, James Madison, George Washington, and a smattering of other characters to illustrate how murky the Founders' intent really was and to dispel the semi-sacred mythological haze which sometimes surrounds them. *American Dialogue* looks backwards at the Founders (if we may canonize them by capitalizing that word), but it also lives securely in the present and gazes tentatively into the future.

Ellis's freedom from the normal epochal boundaries is an important precondition for the historical imperative hinted at in the pages of the book, which is to enlighten us that the mystique of the Constitution and its Founders lies in the process of argument and compromise, not in some "Mandate of Heaven" or infallibility on the part of the mere mortals who wrote the document. This distinction is crucial for what makes up the second half of each chapter,

namely, a discussion of current events ranging from the backlash against the Civil Rights movement to the merits of constitutional originalism. This stands in stark contrast to other recent mainstream scholarship on the Framers, like Jill Lepore's 2018 book, *These Truths: A History of the United States*, for example, which approaches American history in a more direct chronological fashion (although it could likewise be categorized as a timely commentary on whether or how modern America lives up to the ideals present at the founding of the country). On the simplest level, Ellis could have treated each historical episode in the book as an opportunity to tell us what the Founders intended, to become some sort of Delphic Oracle interpreting the vicissitudes of 1789, but Ellis rejects this normative discourse. Indeed, in true modern historical style, he declines to provide any safety blanket or surety at all. There are no solutions and no answers. This is the operative structure that drives home the point Ellis intends from the beginning: no interpretation of the Founders' intentions, whether liberal or conservative, will provide a panacea for the issues we face.

Joseph Ellis, from his perch at Mount Holyoke College where he served as a prominent faculty member (although not without some drama, as the revocation of his endowed chair from 2001 to 2005 shows), has written several presidential biographies, like *American Sphinx: The Character of Thomas Jefferson* (1996) and *His Excellency: George Washington* (2004), and the aim of each of them has been to fill in the shades of grey, to walk readers into conflict without always walking them back out satisfactorily.

The first part of *American Dialogues* once again deals with the complicated ideology of Thomas Jefferson, a tradition of biographies in keeping with the works of David McCullough. Jefferson has been variously configured as the proto-agrarian libertarian who served as the bedrock of a modern ideology which bears the same name, or as the rational secularist who believed in the constant revision of the Constitution. Ellis takes great care in explaining that, in fact, he was both. He was also, as Ellis makes plain, a bundle of contradictions regarding race. While writing fervently during the drafting of the Declaration of Independence about the moral cancer that slavery represented, he also, bafflingly, kept a considerable number of slaves at his lofty retreat of Monticello. Likewise, Jefferson on the one hand believed that miscegenation would be something so anathema to the future states that all freed slaves should be expatriated, and on the other hand spent the majority of his adult life with Sally Hemings, one of his slaves, and produced several children with her. The implication, under Ellis's analysis, was that the rights and values embedded in the Declaration of Independence, which Jefferson drafted, or later in the Constitution and Bill of Rights, clearly did not extend to anyone other than the Anglo-American settlers of the colonies.

The second half of that chapter, dealing with the backlash against Civil Rights after the 1970s, focuses on a problem that has essentially remained unchanged, namely, whether Americans really believe in the possibility of a bi-racial or post-

racial society. The undeniable language of the founding documents is weighed on one side, but the actual beliefs of Americans, with the emerging dog-whistle of “law and order” sublimated into the political ether, are weighed on the other. This part, and indeed most of the current-time sections of the book, while useful didactically, appear like addenda and rely heavily of Ellis’s references to other works, such as Jane Mayer’s *Dark Money* (2016) or Robert Kaplan’s *Earning the Rockies* (2017) later on. This is to be expected for a couple of reasons. First, it lies rather outside the historian’s mandate, whether for the circular and self-inflicted reasoning that “history ended twenty years ago,” or for the fact that current-event commentary treads on the feet of journalists. Second, it fits well with Ellis’s gentle but pedantic style of writing, inviting readers to come to their own conclusions. Regardless, it leaves one with a distinct feeling of needing more, even if plunging into current events opens a Pandora’s Box.

The real heart of Ellis’s premise can be found in the third chapter, which involves James Madison and the purest discussion of “Framers’ Intent” in the Constitution. Using James Madison as a guide, we can see how the aspirations of Madison, Adams, and others were tempered by the political necessities of the day. The retractions, additions, alterations, and other changes made by the Constitutional Convention, as well as Madison’s own nose-counting skills, reveal that the Constitution itself was a deeply unsatisfying compromise. Any claim that the Constitution was somehow the Word of God, or infallible like the Pope when teaching *ex cathedra*, falls away and exposes the process of argument and discourse that serves as Ellis’s main focus. If the Constitution was an inherently negotiated document, which is what Ellis suggests, then we must recognize the fervor of those spirits which fell to the left and right of the final document. In the case Ellis presents, this takes the form of James Madison on the left, ever the idealist, and figures like Patrick Henry on the right.

The second half of the Madison chapter is where Ellis comes into his own, adopting an even more passionate pitch with regard to a special bugbear of his: constitutional originalism. The scene is set with a string of Supreme Court cases decided in the first decade of the new millennium, *District of Columbia v. Heller* (2008), which transformed the jurisprudence on the Second Amendment, and *Citizens United v. FEC* (2010), which allowed for unlimited spending on federal elections by corporations and other entities. Ellis focuses on the “mental gymnastics” (165) of Supreme Court Justice Antonin Scalia who wrote both of the aforementioned decisions. Rather than keeping what historians might call an “open mind” toward the evidence, Ellis suggests that the thought process behind originalism (with its origins among the New Right, its beginnings in law schools like the one at the University of Chicago, and its eventual transformation by the Supreme Court) does exactly the opposite by pre-supposing an outcome and tailoring the evidence and legal theory to fit. This is by far the most political point in the book, and it makes clear exactly what the author’s accumulated

thoughts are on the subject, although this portion is much less scrupulous when it comes to academic references.

If the chapter on Jefferson was primarily backwards-looking to the 1970s and 1980s, and the Madison chapter focused on the here-and-now, the final portion of the book is dedicated to looking toward the future. Ellis finally takes on the most unassailable of the Founders, George Washington, looking for guidance on foreign policy or, as some would have it more broadly, “the United States in the World.” This has been a most ambiguous topic from the founding of the country and remains so even today. Ellis paints a picture of Washington that is very favorable, perhaps embracing the fact that the Founders were concerned with their own posterity, even though Ellis spares no breath discussing the hypocrisies of Jefferson and Adams. The primary focus of Washington’s conduct as president in this book concerns his appraisal of the Indian territory, and, true to form, Ellis presents us with a largely unknown facet of Washington’s administration, namely the recognition of the various Indian territories as having treaty status as nations with definite boundaries and all the rights of other nations. As Ellis goes on to explain, however, this method was doomed from the start as settlers in Georgia invaded Creek territory with no way for the federal government to prevent it, short of war on its own citizens. Ellis uses Washington’s noble cause and ultimate failure with the Indian territory to demonstrate some of the struggles that America has faced and continues to face in its relationship to the world. The debate whether America could exist as a republic while forcefully incorporating territory, for instance, was a major theme up until the 1920s, and ever afterwards America has had to struggle with the definition of empire in a neo-colonial world order dominated by American interests. Washington and the discussion of foreign policy is a useful segue to the final addendum to Ellis’s book, which he calls “Leadership,” a contemplation of what made the Founders so unique and an indirect comparison with American leadership today. This is perhaps the chapter with the most left *unsaid*, not only for the purposes that govern the whole book, but also as a tacit refusal to venture into the realm of the purely political.

American Dialogue, while it is researched and written by an expert in the field, should not be mistaken for a scholarly monograph meant to be a modest staple of academic discourse. It can be read satisfactorily by a very wide audience, which seems to be the book’s intent from the outset, and that fact meshes well with the message of the book, which is to encourage informed debate and participation in the construction of our shared future. It is a book with a clear intent, both didactically and philosophically, much like the lines of inquiry in other recent works attempting to dispel myths about the Framers, such as *The Partisan Republic: Democracy, Exclusion, and the Fall of the Founders’ Constitution, 1780s-1830s* by Gerald Burke Leonard and Saul Cornell (2019). While it does not rise to the level of a must-read for all Americans, it is timely. *American Dialogue* thrives in the cultural moment and will remain relevant for a long time.

ABOUT THE REVIEWER: *Ian Woodson Fisher of Brea, California, earned his B.M. in Music Composition and his B.A. in History at California State University, Fullerton (CSUF) (2020), where he is a member of the Theta-Pi Chapter of Phi Alpha Theta (History Honor Society). He is active as a writer of avant-garde contemporary music. He also served as an editor for this volume of "The Welebaethan: A Journal of History."*

Espinoza, Dionne, María Eugenia Coterá, and Maylei Blackwell, eds.
Chicana Movidas: New Narratives of Activism and Feminism in the Movement Era.

Austin: University of Texas Press, 2018. 488 pages. ISBN: 9781477316825 (e-book).

The Chicano Movement of the mid-twentieth century marked an era of revolution, resistance, and re-organization as there was a far-reaching cry for equality by Chicana individuals. People from different generations, genders, and sexualities in the Chicana communities joined the movement, however, their contributions have yet to be recognized. Dionne Espinoza, María Eugenia Coterá, and Maylei Blackwell's anthology, *Chicana Movidas: New Narratives of Activism and Feminism in the Movement Era*, provides a space for individuals to voice their experiences, engagement, and understanding of the different movements in which Chicanas and individuals from the LGBTQ communities participated.

All three editors are accomplished scholars in their respective fields. Dionne Espinoza is a professor of Women's, Gender, and Sexuality Studies at California State University, Los Angeles. She is known for her award-winning book, *Enriqueta Vasquez and the Chicano Movement: Writings from El Grito del Norte* (2006), which she co-edited with Lorena Oropeza. María Eugenia Coterá is the director of the program in Latina/o Studies and a professor of Latina/o Studies, Gender Studies, Digital Studies, Social Movements, and Comparative Ethnic Studies at the University of Michigan. She is the author of *Native Speakers: Ella Deloria, Zora Neale Hurston, Jovita Gonzalez and the Poetics of Culture* (2008) and the director of "Chicana por mi Raza," a digital archive used to preserve Chicana and Latina memories and histories. Maylei Blackwell is a professor of Chicana/Chicano Studies and Women's Studies at the University of California, Los Angeles, the author of *¡Chicana Power! Contested Histories of Feminism in the Chicano Movement* (2011), as well as an activist. The anthology *Chicana Movidas*, edited by Espinoza, Coterá, and Blackwell, provides readers with an impressive selection of essays penned by a wide range of scholars and activists, covering the experiences of Chicanas and LGBTQ individuals during both the Chicano Movement and the Civil Rights movement from the late 1950s to the late 1980s.

The editors outline the different movements or *movidas* in which Chicanas from different parts of the Western Hemisphere participated, suggesting that there was a wide range of small, individual movements, and that some of these were hidden and not widely known. The editors define *movidas* as "outside of the specular range of large-scale political and social relations. Enacted in backrooms and bedrooms, hallways and kitchens, they are collective and individual maneuvers, undertaken in a context of social mobilization, that seek to work within, around, and between the positionings, ideologies, and practices of

publicly visible social relations.” (2) The goal of this anthology is to examine the key role Chicanas played in the Chicano Movement through their daily acts of work and support within and around organizational spaces.

The anthology is divided into four sections, based on four different types of *movidas*: “Hallway *Movidas*” (33-119), “Home-Making *Movidas*” (123-224), “*Movidas* of Crossing” (227-296), and “Memory *Movidas*” (299-374). Hallway *movidas* is both a literal and metaphorical term that refers to the strategy that Chicanas used by meeting in discreet locations to oppose hypermasculine and oppressive scenarios. (12-14) Home-making *movidas* alludes to instances when Chicanas had to make their own spaces when they felt that they were being excluded and it was not possible for them to create inclusive spaces within organizations or movements. (15-20) *Movidas* of crossing occurred when Chicanas crossed the borders of different movements, the borders of race and gender, or the borders of nation-states. Individuals from the Chicana community participated in *movidas* of crossing when they organized with and fought for Third World countries, women of color, against imperialism, against poverty, for warfare rights, and for immigrants. (21-23) Memory *movidas* involved writings (including poetry and *testimonios*), archives, and oral histories. (23-30)

The anthology contains a total of twenty-one essays in its four sections. One essay that I find especially compelling and inspiring is Chapter 6, “*La Causa de los Pobres: Alicia Escalante’s Lived Experiences of Poverty and the Struggle for Economic Justice*,” by Rosie C. Bermudez (123-137). Alicia Escalante was a single mother who lived in Los Angeles, California. She understood the oppression that lower-class Chicanas had been enduring and wanted to better their circumstances. She did so by creating the “East Los Angeles Welfare Rights Organization” (ELAWRO), one of the earliest Chicana advocacy organizations to challenge public policies and address their negative impact on women. The “East Los Angeles Welfare Rights Organization” fought to give single Chicana mothers the resources they needed to care for their children and homes. Bermudez’s essay is placed in the anthology’s second section (“Home-Making *Movidas*”) as Escalante had seen that Chicanas did not have a secure space and were being oppressed, which is why she sought to create a space where Chicanas could be independent and free from poverty, as well as racial and sexual oppression.

The anthology’s essays utilize oral histories (*testimonios*), photographs, artwork, and archival material. In the introduction, the editors refer to Gloria Anzaldúa’s analysis of *movimientos* and Chela Sandoval’s definition of *movidas* to explain how they organized their anthology based on the contributions that Chicanas and LGBTQ individuals have made to the Chicano Movement. (1-6) Espinoza’s, Cotera’s, and Blackwell’s anthology moves beyond the idea that the different Chicana and LGBTQ movements and organizations of this period were not interconnected, as they examine how Chicanas and individuals from the LGBTQ communities interacted and connected with movements and organizations that ranged from male-oriented Chicano organizations to other

ethnic organizations. An example of this is Chapter 14, “‘La Raza en Canada’: San Diego Chicana Activists, the Indochinese Women’s Conference of 1971, and Third World Womanism,” by Dionne Espinoza (261-275) in the anthology’s third section (“*Movidas* of Crossing”). This essay examines how a group of Chicanas from San Diego, California, attended two conferences in Vancouver and Toronto, Canada, known as the “Indochinese Women’s Conference” of 1971 and organized to discuss the United States’ involvement in the Vietnam War. The goal of the conference was to unite women from different organizations against the Vietnam War and against U.S. imperialism. According to Espinoza’s findings, Chicana women reached out and connected with organizations and individuals outside the Chicax community in order to unite around a common goal. Espinoza demonstrates that political organizations during the Civil Rights Movement did not operate in isolation from each other.

The editors also break down barriers between generations and types of engagement as they explain in the introduction: “while the volume includes essays by established and emerging scholars from a variety of disciplinary fields (history, religious studies, anthropology, media studies, creative writing), added to this mix are new essays by an earlier generation of Chicana feminists [...] who offer not only critical firsthand perspectives on the organizations, individuals, and events that shaped Chicana *movidas* in the 1960s and 1970s, but also their own historical analyses of the events and organizations in which they were involved.” (4) Such differences between the essays’ individual authors offer readers a wide range of voices and perspectives. The use of transgenerational networks of scholars (4) lays out the scope of the Chicax movement as each essay pertains to a different sequence of events and is written with different objectives. Readers will appreciate that much of the information provided has not previously been published, as many of the details and events described in the essays had, in the past, “been exiled [...] to spaces of extrainstitutional memory.” (4)

Chicana Movidas approaches a national scale as the anthology transcends the common portrayal of the Southwest or, as it is referred to, Aztlán. (5) *Chicana Movidas* takes into account other locations that saw activities of the Chicax movement, such as the Pacific Northwest, for example, Chapter 8, “*Feminista* Frequencies: Chicana Radio Activism in the Pacific Northwest,” by Monica De La Torre (159-173); as well as Texas, for example, Chapter 10, “The Space in Between: Exploring the Development of Chicana Feminist Thought in Central Texas,” by Brenda Sendejo (189-206). By moving beyond Aztlán and the narrative of the Southwest, the anthology not only examines the movements in a wide range of locations but also during different decades.

Despite the fact that there are a several books available on Chicana activist movements there are none that are truly comparable to *Chicana Movidas*. Prior to publishing *Chicana Movidas*, one of the editors, Maylei Blackwell, had published *Chicana Power! Contested Histories of Feminism in the Chicano Movement* (2011). In

this book, Blackwell analyzes the role a Chicana organization known as *Hijas de Cuauhtémoc* played in the Chicano Movement (1960-1970). Blackwell uses oral histories and archival material to describe the experiences that Chicanas faced during their fight to secure Civil Rights. However, as *Chicana Movidas* states, “because such historical practices fail to engage an intersectional understanding of power and oppression they cannot apprehend the nature of ‘multiple feminist insurgencies’.” (9) *¡Chicana Power!* was the first book to present Chicana involvement in the Chicano Movement and laid the foundation for works like *Chicana Movidas*. *Chicana Movidas* is unique as it describes the connections and overlapping that occurred between movements. In addition, *Chicana Movidas* provides a wide array of movements all presented by a diverse group of individuals. Thus, *Chicana Movidas* embodies the Chicana movement.

Readers with a passion for gender studies and history who are looking for a book that is unique should pick up a copy of *Chicana Movidas*. The essays and narratives in this anthology give a voice to those who were and are different and have been told to remain silent. During the Chicano Movement, many individuals in the Chicano community treated Chicanas and individuals who identified with the LGBTQ community as outsiders and pariahs. Their testimonies, involvement, and contributions were silenced and hidden behind the images and movements of the Chicano organizations. However, it is through the work of scholars like Espinoza, Cotera, and Blackwell that some of the individuals previously hidden from the world are now brought into the light. Chicanas and LGBTQ individuals played an integral and necessary role in the Chicano Movement. Their participation, though at times unnoticed, was revolutionary and indispensable, much like this anthology.

ABOUT THE REVIEWER: *Monique Garcia of Whittier, California, is currently pursuing a B.A. in History and Chicana/Latinx Studies at California State University, Fullerton (CSUF), where she is a member of the Theta-Pi Chapter of Phi Alpha Theta (History Honor Society). She is a member of the University Honors Program and the Mellon Mays Undergraduate Fellowship.*

Gilmore, Leigh.

Tainted Witness: Why We Doubt What Women Say About Their Lives.

New York: Columbia University Press, 2017. 240 pages. ISBN: 9780231543446 (e-book).

In her book, *Tainted Witness: Why We Doubt What Women Say About Their Lives*, Leigh Gilmore maintains that “two of the stickiest judgments that circulate in response to claims by women of sexual violence are ‘he said/she said’ and ‘nobody really knows what happened’.” (6) The author demonstrates how testimony walks a fine line between truth and fiction in search of justice. Unequal judgments often fall upon women who bear witness in public. Gilmore examines feminist, literary, and legal contexts to demonstrate what happens when women’s testimonies are discredited. While women’s testimonial accounts convey the power of body and speech in the public sphere, these accounts lack

security and control; thus, authenticity to their claims is undermined. Gilmore asks that we conceptualize testimonial networks as circulatory systems and look beyond rules of evidence to how a witness is to testify in court, and beyond norms around reviewing and commenting on print and online reviews. Autobiography may be open to innovation, but testimony is in search of an adequate witness, and while testimony moves, judgment sticks. In Gilmore's view, "women are often seen as unpersuasive witnesses for three related reasons: because they are women, because through testimony they seek to bear witness to inconvenient truths, and because they possess less symbolic and material capital than men as witnesses in courts of law." (18) Women victims who assert and claim political and/or personal freedom are asked if they knew the men who harmed them, if they ever tempted those same men, and why they did not leave in the face of danger.

Leigh Gilmore is a visiting professor of Women's and Gender Studies at Wellesley College, and the author of numerous scholarly works on autobiography. *Tainted Witness*, her monograph under review here, consists of an introduction, "Tainted Witness in Testimonial Networks" (1-26); Chapter 1, "Anita Hill, Clarence Thomas, and the Search for an Adequate Witness" (27-58); Chapter 2, "Jurisdictions and Testimonial Networks: Rigoberta Menchú" (59-84); Chapter 3, "Neoliberal Life Narrative: From Testimony to Self-Help" (85-118); Chapter 4, "Witness by Proxy: Girls in Humanitarian Storytelling" (119-132); Chapter 5, "Tainted Witness in Law and Literature: Nafissatou Diallo and Jamaica Kincaid" (133-156); and a conclusion, "Testimonial Publics: #BlackLivesMatter and Claudia Rankine's *Citizen*" (157-170).

Anita Hill, Chapter 1's protagonist, was vulnerable to political attack when sharing her testimony with the world, and Hill's testimony and sexual harassment became an issue for white feminists. Gilmore explores the tainting of Anita Hill and her testimony as part of a larger social history, where she found herself in a system that refused to believe what she said. Gilmore states, "The rush to judgment encourages framing testimonial conflicts in terms of who is telling the truth and who is lying, with the presumption that this is an adequate and meaningful testimonial test. Such a framing, however, prevents witnesses from providing adequate context for their testimony." (31) Hill lacked an advocate who could "fill in the gaps," which was central to understanding sexual harassment publicly. Hill's testimony and sexual harassment when she worked as an attorney was underestimated and subject to two forms of witness tainting, one within the hearing and the other a smear campaign that involved misrepresentation, false allegations, and theatrics.

In Chapter 2, Gilmore states, "the public smearing of Anita Hill in many ways provided the playbook for how conservatives like [Dinesh] D'Souza and [David] Horowitz would bash [Rigoberta] Menchú." (67) The publication of Rigoberta Menchú's *testimonio* claimed that security forces were responsible for the deaths of her father and others. Menchú's *testimonio*, a personal account based on an

interview Menchú gave rather than a book she wrote, was originally offered to a large international audience as a *testimonio* that soon became a subject of doubt. Gilmore agrees that testimony attracts judgment when she writes, “as a target of tainting, her *testimonio* is stuck in the jurisdiction of scandal and suffers the fate of dragging forward that story with subsequent efforts to bear witness to ongoing political crises around Indigenous, women’s, and human rights.” (83) Menchú was attacked by well-funded conservatives for “lying” when Third World authors began replacing required curriculum taught in universities across the United States. This was seen as an attack on Western values and civilizations. When Menchú traveled from Guatemala via Mexico to Paris, she exposed herself to the world and elicited scandal. Testimony generated and attracted judgment against controversial texts that did not fall within Western norms.

According to Chapter 3, the “memoir boom” in the late twentieth century can be attributed to the increase in redemption narratives. The widespread attention and appeal on women’s life stories came with an immediate backlash against the memoir format, specifically women’s memoirs. Witness tainting, as the author describes it, or judgments against controversial texts remained the same, only they had been released and recognized differently than what was typically featured in memoirs by famous men. Despite nominal recognition, scholars greeted these stories with criticism; memoirs that featured supposedly tainted testimonial witnesses and “liars” were now routine. Gilmore states, “they were tagged as both lies and inconvenient truths, and their authors were shamed, sidelined, and turned into examples of the excesses of identity politics, and increasingly of the pitfalls of memoir itself. Women’s testimonial narratives in the last decades of the twentieth century were displaced by a new influx of neoliberal life narratives.” (88) The author also addresses marketability when considering how we are to keep feminist witnesses in view. According to Gilmore, “if an unattractive woman were to write a book about sleeping with her father, it would not command the same media real estate as an attractive woman sleeping with her father.” (94) Women’s testimonial narratives did not have a fighting chance because these accounts were contextualized as commodities to feminine appeal, and one woman’s account could be substituted with any other.

In Chapter 4, Gilmore looks at neoliberal humanitarian narratives through Greg Mortenson’s *Three Cups of Tea* (2006). Mortenson wrote in the third person and used interviews, photographs, and narration to promote a “schools, not bombs” program of humanitarian engagement to counter the rise of the Taliban in Afghanistan and Pakistan. Gilmore argues that the book is not simply about relating the girls’ stories to a First World audience to begin with. She states, “the lives of girls and women from the global South are transformed into vehicles for Western audiences to feel in particular ways: to experience themselves as caring and philanthropic, to have, in the ghostly embodiment of this discourse, their eyes opened and hearts touched. The actual life stories of women and girls are proxy lives that advance Mortenson’s agenda.” (124) According to the author,

Mortenson sought to advance humanitarian aims through storytelling, and used the stories of vulnerable girls and women to convey messages about global citizenship. Mortenson's use of the Third World girls' life stories to construct humanitarian heroism was quite strategic, allowing him to navigate the testimonial network authoritatively and unseen. Gilmore argues that accounts such as Mortenson's are not only narrow, but they seemingly contextualize women's testimony through use of witness by proxy.

In Chapter 5, Gilmore presents two unsympathetic women witnesses of color – West African immigrant Nafissatou Diallo who, in 2011, testified against Dominique Strauss-Kahn (at the time the managing director of the International Monetary Fund), and an unsympathetic woman witness in *The Autobiography of My Mother* by Jamaica Kincaid (1996) – to examine the mode of reading two very complex accounts of harm, precarity, and agency. Gilmore writes, “if we think of a life as what a person must offer up without translation or other form of facilitation in order to testify compellingly and authentically, then we draw a sharp generic line between fact and fiction and name the management of that line, by the writer and others, in terms of ethics.” (148) Testimony seeks witnesses and moves for diverse audiences. This chapter focuses on testimonies as they engage with rape discourse. Gilmore claims that “these narratives have a life of their own, an agentic force we associate with the power of discourse to mediate the translation of lived events into witness accounts.” (155)

According to Gilmore's conclusion in *Tainted Witness*, “testimony is an increasingly central feature of contemporary life, as is the judgment that accompanies it and attaches, in specific ways, to the life stories of women. Anita Hill's testimony at Clarence Thomas's confirmation hearing, Rigoberta Menchú's *testimonio* about genocide in Guatemala, and Nafissatou Diallo's claim that she was raped by Dominique Strauss-Kahn demonstrate the vulnerabilities of women witnesses in the courts and in the public square but also the importance of these same witnesses to expose the contexts and histories that construct and perpetuate vulnerability.” (157) Gilmore proceeds to discuss the emergence and significance of #BlackLivesMatter following Trayvon Martin's killing in 2012. She states, “Trayvon Martin, a seventeen-year-old African American high school student, was fatally shot by George Zimmerman, a neighborhood watch volunteer/vigilante, who stalked Martin as he walked to a convenience store in Sanford, Florida, to buy candy and a soda. When Zimmerman was not charged in the killing, a wave of protest was ignited nationwide, in part, through social activism online.” (160) Gilmore brings up the Trayvon Martin case to show what legacies of racial violence in the United States were brought to the light as a result. She states, “yet when women wish to bear witness in public, the protective devices of literature are not at hand, and the full risks of being deemed crazy or criminal exist.” (170) The author attempts to answer why women are so often considered unreliable witnesses to their own experiences, how they might be discredited in court, why women's testimonies are often mirrored in

controversies fueled by histories of slavery and colonialism, and how new feminist witnesses might enter testimonial networks and disrupt doubt; she examines the doubt in women's testimonies through a feminist, literary, and legal lens. *Tainted Witness* is recommended reading.

ABOUT THE REVIEWER: *Andrea Young Paik of Brea, California, earned her B.A. in Comparative Literature with a minor in Spanish at the University of California, Irvine (UCI) (2011). She is currently pursuing an M.A. in English at California State University, Fullerton (CSUF). She is working in the Los Angeles Unified School District.*

Guiet, Daniel C., and Timothy K. Smith.

Scholars of Mayhem: My Father's Secret War in Nazi-Occupied France.

New York: Penguin Press, 2019. 272 pages. ISBN: 9780735225206.

All it takes is one moment to change one's life and one's family's history. *Scholars of Mayhem: My Father's Secret War in Nazi-occupied France* recounts the untold and fateful encounters of Jean Claude Guiet (1924-2013) while fighting as a secret agent in the heart of Nazi-occupied France. Its author, Daniel C. Guiet, is the son of Jean Claude Guiet who in turn is the subject of this book. Daniel Guiet attended the University of Colorado, and he told his father's story with the help of Timothy K. Smith, a seasoned writer and editor for, among others, *Fortune Magazine* and the *Wall Street Journal*. *Scholars of Mayhem* opens with an account of Daniel Guiet making a shocking discovery. At the age of five, Daniel happened upon a secret box that was never to be touched. The curiosity of a child's unoccupied mind can sometimes be dangerous, but in this case led to a moment of realization. He knew that his decision to open that fateful box would get him into trouble, which is why he made a point to reassemble the contents in the exact order in which he had pulled them out. What is most fascinating is that he was able to acknowledge, in retrospect, that he did not comprehend what he was seeing: magazine clippings and documents, such as passports and IDs with his father's image, but with false names.

Part 1 of *Scholars of Mayhem* examines the role Jean Claude Guiet played in the SOE (Special Operations Executive). Often called Winston Churchill's secret army, the SOE officially did not exist and operated outside of international law. SOE agents were not members of an intelligence service or a special forces group, they formed an organization of their own. By no means was Guiet one of the founding members of the SOE; he was just one agent among many. Part 1 also looks at notable figures that Guiet worked with during his time in the SOE. One of these was Philippe Liewer, or "the organizer," whose ears were apparently far too prominent, so he had them surgically pinned back to avoid being noticed during his clandestine work with the SOE. Another one was Violette Szabo, or "the courier;" apart from all the ferocious work she did against the Nazis, her very first task to aid in the war effort was to pick strawberries. And then there was Robert ("Bob") Maloubier, or "the saboteur," who became part of the SOE

after a fateful night when he was offered to be smuggled out of the country in exchange for his commitment to SOE.

Part 2 looks at the ways in which Jean Claude Guiet prepared for his missions. While he was in college at Harvard, Guiet made the decision to join the United States Army when he received his draft notice in the mail. He joined the military on June 9, 1943, and it quickly became apparent that Guiet was just the type of man that the U.S. Office of Strategic Services (OSS) was looking for. He quickly completed his OSS training and got promoted. After having completed several missions with the Office of Strategic Services, he was selected for advanced commando training. He was then sent to wireless operations training where he learned Morse code among other codes for transmitting messages, and he eventually received paratrooper training. All of this prepared him well for conducting a mission.

Part 3 looks at the mission that Jean Claude Guiet and his team members set out to conduct, "Operation Salesman II," and takes up nearly half of the book. It follows Jean Claude, Philippe, Violette, and Bob as they conduct their clandestine mission. The characteristic tactics of "Operations Salesman II" can be described as asymmetric warfare. This classification results from their characteristic use of ambushes, sabotage, and sniping. Any reader who enjoys the stories of secret missions, the tales of coded messages, sabotage, and daring escapes with uncertain outcomes will be thrilled. The first few days of "Operation Salesman II" were wrought with trouble. Its members did not seem to be fully prepared, and, to top it off, Violette was captured by the Germans for interrogation and never heard from again. As a result of the loss of Violette, her duties had to be split between the remaining members, putting an even greater strain on them. The first few days of the mission were more of an administrative nature. Phillippe was collecting intelligence, Bob was training explosives recruits, and Jean Claude was coding and decoding messages.

These SOE operatives joined forces with the outlaw army that Georges Guingouin had formed in France. Guingouin was a secretary of the Communist Party in Eymoutiers and was a doctrinaire communist who was loyal to the cause. He formed an outlaw group in the woods when the French Communist Party took a neutral stance and refused to take sides in an "imperialist" war. When the "Operations Salesman II" team met with Guingouin, he already had three thousand men under his command, and these men proved to be a big factor in the success of the operation. After the deal with Guingouin had been struck and the groups had been properly armed, Jean Claude saw the opportunity to really get into action. He was given a combat role and was instantly used for radio transmissions and coding. The next few days saw a series of ambushes and drops that were crucial to supplying the group. The operatives also launched a series of sabotage missions.

There was an offensive in which the team did not fare too well, and, as a result, Philippe sent for the Operations Group of OSS commandos that were

under joint command with the SOE for assistance. A few weeks later, with these new agents at their disposal, the team launched a series of ambushes and an offensive on the city of Limoges. As they were clearing out of Limoges, the team conducted raiding parties in an attempt to clear out the remaining enemy strong points. The work that these agents conducted in Limoges resulted in a set of tribunals that saw Bob and Jean Claude awarded with a medal for heroism in combat from the French government.

The epilogue turns to the life of the team after the war. Violette Szabo's body was never found after she had been executed by the Nazis. Upon confirmation of her death, she was awarded the United Kingdom's George Cross for bravery. Bob Maloubier chose to join SOE Force 136, a commando group that aided resistance groups in Japanese-occupied Southeast Asian territories. Jean Claude Guiet was arrested by a joint French-American patrol for being AWOL, but the documents he produced procured his immediate release. He was then presented with two options and chose to attend jungle training on Catalina Island in preparation to fight the Japanese in China and Burma. He lived a long life and died in 2013 at the age of eighty-nine. Before Guiet left from his arrest, he hurried away and managed to say goodbye to Bob, but he was not able to make contact with Philippe, and he never heard from him or saw him again. It appears that Philippe was decorated by both the French and British governments after the war, and that he died of a heart attack in Casablanca, Morocco, in 1948.

The three parts and multiple subchapters of *Scholars of Mayhem* are of uneven length. This is understandable, since Part 1 and Part 2 essentially serve as introductions to the story of "Operation Salesman II" (Part 3). Guiet's and Smith's style of writing is quite refreshing, and their vivid story-telling abilities and descriptive skills will keep their readers' attention. At times, however, the authors' focus on details can be a little overbearing, especially in Part 1. What this book is significantly lacking, though, is a grounding in the historical record. This is a great story that, especially in Part 3, almost reads like a novel, but readers with historical sensibilities will want a more differentiated discussion of the primary evidence that serves as the basis for this story, as well as more information about the historical context.

If one is interested in learning more about the subject of the SOE, books like *Secret Agent: The True Story of the Special Operations Executive* by David Stafford (2000) and Ted Allbeury's *A Time Without Shadows* (1992) and *As Time Goes By* (1994) are perfect. If one is interested in reading what the SOE agents had to learn in their coursework, then the *Special Operations Executive Manual: How to Be an Agent in Occupied Europe* (1942, republished 2014) is perfect because it is the course that future agents actually received to prepare for their work. Another pertinent book is *Dead on Time: The Memoir of an SOE and OSS Agent in Occupied France* by Jean Claude Guiet himself (2016).

That said, *Scholars of Mayhem* is a great book to get the general reader interested in history and is therefore highly recommended. It features fascinating

information about what Jean Claude Guiet went through during his fight in France. Avid World War II historians will appreciate this book because it provides an in-depth look into the clandestine activities of Jean Claude Guiet and other SOE agents.

ABOUT THE REVIEWER: *Sierra Rey Sampson of West Covina, California, earned her B.A. in History (2017) and her M.A. in History (2020) at California State University, Fullerton (CSUF), where she is a member of the Theta-Pi Chapter of Phi Alpha Theta (History Honor Society). She served as an editor for Volume 46 (2019) of "The Welebaethan: A Journal of History."*

Hochschild, Adam.

Spain in Our Hearts: Americans in the Spanish Civil War, 1936-1939.

Boston: Houghton Mifflin Harcourt, 2016. 480 pages. ISBN: 9780547973180.

In his monograph *Spain in Our Hearts: Americans in the Spanish Civil War, 1936-1939*, published in 2016, Adam Hochschild brilliantly describes the true story of Americans who volunteered to go to Spain in support of the Second Spanish Republic in its struggle against the Fascist army rebels led by Francisco Franco. This was a conflict in which the U.S. government wanted to play no part, which is historically significant (and ironic) because most Americans are woefully unaware of the heroism and sacrifices made by the Americans who went to Spain to fight the spread of fascism. Therefore, this review will be divided into two parts. The first half of the review will be a general summary of the story in Hochschild's monograph. The second half will be an analysis of why the author was successful in conveying to readers the full story of the American volunteers who fought in defense of the Spanish Republic against Franco's forces.

The book starts off with the story of the economic depression afflicting the world at that time, before transitioning to the outbreak of the Civil War in Spain in 1936. The book then moves on to the recruitment of volunteers from around the world, including the United States, by the Soviet Union into the military forces known as the International Brigades, all the while telling about the everyday lives of Americans who volunteered to go to Spain, including Bob and Marion Merriman, Charles and Lois Orr, James Yates, Toby Jensky, Virginia Cowles, Ernest Hemingway, and Louis Fischer, as well as several British individuals who also volunteered to go to Spain in order to fight fascism, such as Jason Gurney, George Orwell, and Orwell's wife. The book then describes how the tide turned against the Second Spanish Republic, and the repression which occurred in Spain following Franco's victory. It then discusses Spain's role in World War II. Finally, the monograph explains in detail the lives of the American (and British) International Brigade volunteers after the Spanish Civil War, their experiences during World War II and the Cold War, and their eventual rehabilitation and return to Spain following the country's transition to democracy after Franco's death in 1975.

The author of *Spain in Our Hearts*, Adam Hochschild, graduated from Harvard University in 1963 with a B.A. in History and Literature. As a college student, he spent one summer working for an anti-government newspaper in South Africa and eventually served as a Civil Rights activist in Mississippi for a brief amount of time in 1964. Much of Hochschild's writing has been centered on historical events involving the issues of social justice and human rights. Besides *Spain In Our Hearts*, his most famous works include *The Unquiet Ghost: Russians Remember Stalin* (1994), *King Leopold's Ghost: A Story of Greed, Terror, and Heroism in Colonial Africa* (1998), and *Bury the Chains: Prophets and Rebels in the Fight to Free an Empire's Slaves* (2005). In addition to writing books, Hochschild has published articles in various journals and magazines, including *Harper's Magazine*, *The Atlantic*, *The New York Times Magazine*, and *The Nation*.

Spain in Our Hearts is divided into five main parts, each consisting of several chapters. The first part describes the background of the Spanish Civil War. The second part focuses on the outbreak of the conflict and some of its early battles. The third part goes into detail about the military and political events that took place during the height of the conflict. The fourth part deals with the fall of the Second Spanish Republic and Spain's role during World War II. The fifth and final part of the monograph discusses the lives of the International Brigade volunteers from the end of the war to Spain's democratization in the late 1970s and early 1980s. In terms of content, the monograph contains a mix of numerous scenes involving the conflict's battles, the political situation, international involvement in the Spanish Civil War, and the personal, emotional experiences of the Americans and British citizens who volunteered to go to Spain, whether to fight for the Second Spanish Republic as members of the International Brigades, to provide humanitarian aid to Spanish refugees fleeing the frontlines, or to report on the status of the Civil War. In terms of usage of historical material, Hochschild has drawn upon a diverse array of both primary and secondary sources, including archival material (such as the Abraham Lincoln Brigade Archives), theses (such as those of Dudley Quentin, Magdalena Bogacka-Rode, Sarah Cooper, and Ashley Johnson), and above all, books and articles (including works written by Michael Alpert, Richard Baxell, and Sebastian Balfour).

What sets Adam Hochschild's monograph apart from other nonfiction works on the Spanish Civil War is that it tells the story and consequences of the war from different angles, specifically the military, political, and personal (i.e., the war as experienced by the volunteers to Spain) aspects of the conflict. Whereas most other monographs focus on only one of these different aspects, *Spain in Our Hearts* instead weaves these aspects together into a single, cohesive narrative that perfectly balances these various aspects. In addition, Hochschild's work also provides little known facts about the war that are hardly ever mentioned by other historians. For example, few know that Franco's fascist rebels won the war, among other factors, because his army was being supplied with oil from a company called Texaco which was run by a man named Torkild Rieber. Few

historians have discussed this detail in their works, something that Hochschild wanted to rectify while working on his monograph.

The only problem with Hochschild's book is that it should have gone more into detail about Spain's transition to democracy in the late 1970s and early 1980s, following the death of Franco in 1975, as the only section of the book that deals with it, Part 5, consists of only two chapters. Overall, Hochschild has done an outstanding job of helping to convey the heroism and sacrifices displayed by American volunteers in the Spanish Civil War, and I highly recommend this book to any student of history, young or old.

ABOUT THE REVIEWER: *Nicholas Duy Nguyen of Anaheim, California, is currently pursuing a B.A. in History at California State University, Fullerton (CSUF).*

McCullough, David.

The American Spirit: Who We Are and What We Stand For.

New York: Simon & Schuster, 2017. 192 pages. ISBN: 9781501174216.

"Study a masterpiece, take it apart, study its architecture, its vocabulary, its intent," says David McCullough in one of his speeches which he has compiled into this small, fifteen-chapter book. Perhaps this review is an attempt to do just that, for this book is a masterpiece. (147) The cover of *The American Spirit* features an American flag and appears to be painted with brush strokes on a white background, with a texture emulative of canvas paper. The book begins with a quote by George Washington, "Perseverance and spirit have done wonders in all ages." (inside cover) And as McCullough attempts to paint the spirit of the United States, he chooses to paint in the medium of history.

History is many things to David McCullough. It is a source of strength for us, an inspiration. We need to know about history because we need to know about human nature and ourselves. Problems have histories, and often the wisest route to a successful solution is to understand its history. People also have histories and to understand them, you have to understand what they have been through. History allows us to understand the world in which we live. If people try to understand the reasons why things happen, a kind of simplicity emerges. We should learn history because we owe it to others from whom we have benefitted, to them who have made contributions to the human spirit. It is a point of respect. Also, by learning history we can become better human beings. From history we learn that sooner is not necessarily better. We learn to avoid self-pity and self-importance, as others had it worse than we do or did things more significant in their time. It also teaches that anything inauthentic rarely lasts and that character matters above all. History teaches us that actions have consequences. It teaches us to behave better. It breaks down dividers between fields, so that everything coheres into one subject. And history is art that goes beyond facts. "Facts rarely if ever have any soul," (143) writes McCullough. And perhaps most importantly, history is composed of both good and bad, but it is the good that defines us—although McCullough does not say why explicitly; perhaps it is because he

believes we are defined by the good in us, and the bad is extraneous to that. In other words, he believes in the spirit.

In this book, McCullough wishes to define the American spirit. He hopes that what he writes will remind us of who we are, what we stand for, and the high aspirations of our founders. So who are we, according to McCullough? Americans are people of vitality and creative energy, tolerance, people who insist on truth, and are good-hearted. We believe in the ideals of the Declaration of Independence. We believe in public schools, freedom of religion, freedom of speech, and equality before the law. And we must not forget that these were novel and daring things at the time they were introduced. We believe in "always doing," as Jefferson said. We believe in courage and patience as Truman said. We believe in trial-and-error; we are not purists or doctrinaires. We are people of grit and determination, as Churchill emphasized (who, although he is not fully American, we adopt as our own). And we are idealists, as Wilson believed. We believe, as our founders did, that our example matters in the world.

But, according to McCullough, the most important things cannot be measured: the integrity of Washington, Lincoln's depth of soul, the courage of Truman, Kennedy at a press conference, Reagan in front of a television. These are indeed things that cannot be measured by any scientist, but they may be captured by an artist, especially one like David McCullough. And while capturing something of the spirit of America, McCullough has advice for us. He asks us to define the national ambition: "We need to talk sense, to speak the truth, to work harder, and stay faithful to our fundamental beliefs." (40) We have to work together in significant ways, but be responsible for our own actions. He advises us to put history into practical use in our everyday lives. He says we need to take an interest in people and get to know their stories, what they have been through. He has advice on how to teach history. It should begin at home and in grade school. And we have to have teachers with great empathy to teach us how to relate to those in the past. He advises us to tell stories, and even shows us how. He quotes E. M. Forster when he said that a king dying, then a queen dying, is a chronicle of events. But a king dying, then a queen dying out of grief for him, is a story. The difference is that the latter gets to our humanity. History, McCullough says, must always be a story. He wishes for us to read, for knowledge is most readily attainable in books. He advises us to choose work we believe in and go to work with spirit. Money will follow well enough, he says. He says that honesty is the best policy. And he advises that, whenever we stay in a hotel or inn, we always tip the maid. As most works of literature demonstrate, it is the small things that matter, for they tell us much about our basic character, our spirit.

There are concerns that scholars as well as others have had with David McCullough. And given his background and the subject matter and success of his work, these seem to be relatively rare. Although lacking an advanced, or any, degree in History (he has a Bachelor's degree in English from Yale), McCullough

is one of our most illustrious American historical writers, having received the Presidential Medal of Freedom (2006) as well as twice the Pulitzer Prize (1993 and 2002), first for *Truman*, then for *John Adams*, the latter selling over three million copies, an extraordinary number for a book on history. Regarding his work on Truman, he was criticized for seeming to justify the use of the atomic bomb due to information Truman had about the cost of life should the United States have to invade Japan. The historian Sean Wilentz criticized McCullough's work on John Adams for not delving further into Adams's works of political theory, which he sees as more historically significant than some of the other things McCullough focuses on. For his most recent work, *Pioneers* (2019), McCullough has been criticized for not focusing enough on Native Americans, especially given the new research that has been done in the past few years, and for some of his language which seems to confirm stereotypes of them. Some of these criticisms are legitimate, but the art of McCullough is to try to get into the minds and hearts of the people whose stories he is trying to tell, through their eyes, bringing out their humanity. And, in some instances, he may go too far in trying to do that. But that is a failing that is, after all, human. That said, he seems to be able to bring things to life with a mastery of his words and his empathy. He is able to recreate the essence of the Johnstown Flood, of a young Theodore Roosevelt, of the building of the Brooklyn Bridge, of John Adams, and, in this case, the spirit of the United States.

And the book does seem to be of importance. Many in our younger generation seem to have a dismal view of America and its history. It is one only of slavery, the extermination of the Indigenous, the oppression of one group after another. This view of the country seems to match the views of many during and after the war in Vietnam, and perhaps part of the reason why we see these views so common today has to do with the wars in Iraq and Afghanistan. But what McCullough does is to focus on the good struggling against the bad. To him, America is an experiment: a country founded on good principles that has always been trying to become better. It contains elements that are problematic, but these elements do not define us; it is the human beings and their principles that struggle against these problematic elements that do.

To David McCullough, history is a humanity. It is an art that we must learn as well as practice in our daily lives. From it, we may learn how to be better human beings. We may learn how to better understand others as well as ourselves. It tells us about our past, present, as well as our future. It tells us who we are, based on what we stand for. For it is what we stand for that defines us. McCullough is an artist whose medium is history, and the base of his paint is words. With great skill with those words and his empathy, he is able to paint something of our spirit. His book, *The American Spirit*, is highly recommended.

ABOUT THE REVIEWER: *Amer Hamid of Woodland Hills, California, earned his B.S. in Computer Science at Purdue University in West Lafayette, Indiana (2003). He is currently*

pursuing an M.A. in History at California State University, Fullerton (CSUF), focusing on American history and English literature.

Natale, Simone.

Supernatural Entertainments:

Victorian Spiritualism and the Rise of Modern Media Culture.

University Park: Pennsylvania State University Press, 2017; first published 2016. 248 pages. ISBN: 9780271071053.

When reflecting on his lifetime career of business ventures and showmanship featuring séances, freakshows, and circuses, P. T. Barnum (1810-1891) remarked, "the great ambition should be to excel all others engaged in the same occupation." Reading Simone Natale's compelling new work, *Supernatural Entertainments: Victorian Spiritualism and the Rise of Modern Media Culture*, brings this statement to its full realization. The study of Spiritualism has been long and varied, with major shifts in its historiography occurring in the 1950s, 1980s, and more recently at the turn of the twenty-first century. While scholars of Spiritualism have examined the role of women in the movement, as well as the religious and scientific aspects of the religion, they have paid very little attention to the movement's role in the development of mass media culture. Natale's new methodological approach clearly identifies Spiritualism's rise to popularity alongside the development of mass media culture throughout the nineteenth century in both Europe and the United States.

Natale, a professor of Communications and Media Studies at Loughborough University in the United Kingdom, begins by offering a brief overview of Spiritualism's origins in the United States and Europe during the nineteenth century. He argues, "three aspects of nineteenth-century Spiritualism are crucial to understanding its spectacular nature: first, the participatory character of the Spiritualist experience; second, the coexistence of claims of authenticity with a spectacular frame; and third, the openness to different, potentially divergent interpretations of the event." (9) For Natale, the séance was a performance, much in same vain as a stage show or theatrical production. Unlike most other Spiritualism scholars, Natale views the deeply held religious views of the movement as secondary to the importance of the spectacle it provided.

Natale's book consists of three parts, each containing two chapters: "Configurations of Séances," "How to Sell a Spirit," and "Spirit and Matter" all focus on the major aspects of Spiritualism and its connection to the rise of mass media entertainment. In the first chapter ("The Medium on the Stage: Theatricality and Performance in the Spirit Séance"), Natale addresses the configurations of the séance, the most important ritual associated with the movement. (21-41) He explores the séance as an entertaining distraction, much in the same vein as amusement parks, carnivals, and traveling freak shows. Séances were not solely religious in nature, quite the contrary: one of the main functions of séances was to entertain and mesmerize the masses who attended them. While Natale acknowledges that séances were framed as very real encounters with the

spirits of the dead, he argues, much like other scholars (such as Alex Owen and Amy Lehman) before him, that they still contained theatrical protocols meant to entice those curious about spirit phenomena. (22) Spiritualism, like theater and later film, had its own celebrities which were continuously referenced in newspapers and later radio, such as the Fox Sisters, Daniel Dunglas Home, and Eusapia Palladino. (34) Entertainment was entwined with the movement from the start, and as popular mass media culture began to develop, Spiritualism rose in popularity. They both fed into each other, allowing for a cycle of growth which went unchecked for decades.

The second chapter (“Parlor Games: Play and Social Life in the Haunted House”) builds on previous research and examines the common actions and themes of apparitions summoned during a *séance*. (42-61) Fantastical experiences of spirits engaging in folk dances with clogs, while others etched drawings on curtains and chalkboards, only encouraged participation in these rituals. Natale posits that, throughout the latter half of the nineteenth century, the physical environment, setup, and process of the *séance* became more standardized in order to accommodate the expectations guests often had based on the stories they had read in newspapers and popular Spiritualist editorials. Through this standardization, Spiritualism and the act of performing a *séance* gained wider respect and recognition throughout society, and female mediums used these developments as opportunities to challenge societal norms of the era. Women were often excluded from discussions of politics and economics, but by contacting spirits which supported their viewpoints in a *séance*, these women could then temporarily nullify societal expectations in order to voice their concerns and recommendations. As expected, these women often became the targets of mental institutions and men of high societal standing who would not tolerate this behavior, even in the confines of the *séance* chamber. Natale briefly discusses the case of Florence Crookes, a medium who attracted the attention of scientist William Crookes and converted him to Spiritualism. Since her views were considered radical by some of William’s colleagues, attempts were made to silence her and to discredit William when those attempts failed. (47) It was becoming all too clear within Victorian society that *séances* and the mediums who conducted them, held great influence over their guests.

Part 2 of Natale’s work focuses on the rise of celebrity culture within Spiritualism and how the movement used sensationalism to its advantage. Businessmen such as James W. Cook and P. T. Barnum understood the fundamental idea that doubt and controversy could often help draw attention to a given subject or event, with Barnum allegedly stating “there’s no such thing as bad publicity.” (66) Mediums were keenly aware of this idea and used it to their advantage in order to draw larger crowds to their performances. Natale explains that by performing feats of grandeur which could not be easily explained to the untrained eye, mediums were able to capitalize on those who doubted their authenticity. These skeptics would more than likely be encouraged to attend

multiple shows in order to attempt to prove the fraudulence of a medium's actions, but by doing so they contributed to that medium's profits and fame.

The most famous mediums were treated as celebrities, with a cult of personality surrounding those believed to truly have supernatural or divine gifts. Scientists, psychologists, and religious leaders wrote about mediums to determine the authenticity of their skills, the source of their powers, or the themes found in their readings and séances. Palladino, for example, was featured in over 1,000 articles on psychic phenomena and research by 1908. (92) The clientele who attended readings with these individuals ranged from working class citizens to heads of state. For example, Daniel Dunglas Home's séances were attended by Napoleon III, Czar Alexander II, Queen Sophie of Holland, and even Pope Pius IX on one occasion. Natale points out that maintaining celebrity status was much more difficult for women during this era, given the separation of social spheres between the genders. Women who enjoyed the fame and luxury of a celebrity were often actresses and singers and, thus, part of the entertainment world. Female mediums like Palladino were able to occupy this niche due to the similar entertainment qualities found in a séance. (102-104)

In the final part of his work, Natale analyzes the impact of technological developments throughout the nineteenth century and their connections to Spiritualism. Newspapers were the first sources of mass entertainment utilized by mediums and Spiritualist audiences to attempt to verify contact with the dead. The manifestation of messages from beyond the grave through spirit boards and spirit writings were commonplace. Known as "Automatic Writing," the technique was quickly adopted by many Spiritualist mediums in order to draw the attention of believers and skeptics alike. Natale walks readers through this process in which a medium would claim to make contact with a spirit and, while either possessed by them or influenced by their energy, would begin writing out elaborate messages to loved ones or audience members who wished to speak with them once again. (117-121) In order to dodge accusations of fraud, mediums began to incorporate new techniques into this type of séance, either by writing in a pitch-black room or by devising elaborate mechanisms which gave the illusion that the mediums themselves were not even touching the paper. This added to the layer of spectacle the séance provided to audiences. More importantly, it ensured that audiences would not grow bored of the same repeated setup of previous séances.

With the advent of photography and visual media, Spiritualism again saw a rise in popularity. In 1862, the news of a spirit appearing in a photograph sent shockwaves across the movement. Spiritualist publications, such as *Banner of Light*, celebrated the news as the beginning of a new phase in Spiritualist history. (137) Suddenly, mediums across the United States and Europe became familiar with operating cameras and claimed that spirits were a manifestation which could be visually captured by using this new technology. Crowds flocked to mediums in order to discover if they could provide them with pictures of their

loved ones watching over them. Natale notes that while these new developments allowed Spiritualism to rise once again in popularity, they also opened the door for more fraudulent behaviors, ones which could be systematically and scientifically explained and exposed. (138) William Mumler, credited as one of the earliest pioneers in spirit photography, is best known for the now debunked photo of Abraham Lincoln's ghost hovering over the shoulder of his widow, Mary Todd Lincoln. The work of Mumler and others like him, according to Natale, played into the downfall of spirit photography (and Spiritualism as a whole), because the nature of their work attracted too wide an audience. Those outside of traditional Spiritualist circles were much more critical of the movement and the beliefs associated with it. As a result of its expansion, due to developments in visual media, Spiritualism began to be perceived as a threat to the moral fiber of society. Natale does not dive too deeply into this aspect of Spiritualism's history in order to remain focused on its established relationships with mass media culture and consumerism.

Natale's work is clear, concise, and provides readers who are unfamiliar with the history of Spiritualism with enough background and complementary knowledge to understand the significance and brilliance behind his new methodological approach to the subject. The author establishes his work as an advancement within the overall historiography of Spiritualism and provides a refreshing new take on the religion's role and relationship with the mass media culture of the nineteenth century. From the rise of newspapers and the increased focus on entertainment and consumer culture to the advent of photography, Spiritualism played a crucial part in the expansion of these endeavors. It would not be appropriate to speak of one without the other: "the rise of new spectacular and entertainment practices has stimulated the amusement, the fascination, and the wonder of believers and skeptics, of curious and ecstatic spectators. They have all been equally welcome to join the spectacle of spirits." (173)

ABOUT THE REVIEWER: Christopher Dean Robbins of Brea, California, earned his B.A. in History at California State University, Fullerton (CSUF) (2018), where he is a member and former vice president of the Theta-Pi Chapter of Phi Alpha Theta (History Honor Society). He is currently pursuing an M.A. in History at CSUF, focusing on the history of Spiritualism in Victorian England and North America.

Reséndez, Andrés.

The Other Slavery: The Uncovered Story of Indian Enslavement in America.

Boston: Houghton Mifflin Harcourt, 2017; first published 2016. 448 pages. ISBN: 9780544947108.

The cultural archive can be a powerful tool in a nation's history to either enhance its claims to progressivism or tear down its moral underpinnings. In the United States, the cultural archive holds a stain that can and often does bleed through the fabric of all historical narratives, yet remains mysteriously obscure: the genocide of Indigenous peoples. In Andrés Reséndez's new monograph, *The Other Slavery: The Uncovered Story of Indian Enslavement in America*, we find

arguably one of the most important contributions to the cultural archives of the United States and Central America. In *The Other Slavery*, Reséndez, a professor of History at the University of California, Davis, who specializes in colonial Latin America, borderlands, and the Iberian world, expounds on complex power shifts as results of the American Indigenous slave trade, popular memory, and political influence. The book consists of twelve chapters, an introduction and an epilogue, which uncover the ugly, obscure nature of Indigenous enslavement in the Americas with Reséndez's source-driven, narrative style.

Reséndez spends his introduction establishing certain truths, tackling myths and misguided perceptions, as well asserting the purpose and utility of crafting an expository work such as this one. He sets the facts of Indian slavery against the general practice of slavery in the early modern world, stressing that Indian slavery was illegal yet practiced in plain sight. (4) Comparing Indian slavery to the Atlantic African slave trade, Reséndez asserts that both were immeasurably devastating to Indigenous populations, but his figure of an Indian slave count of nearly five million sets the tone for what is to come. (5) However, the Indian slave trade was and is strikingly obscure in popular memory. As he concludes his introduction, Reséndez proclaims that he is not presenting a comprehensive history of Western slavery, a task that, as he admits, would exceed the page limits of this book, and that he utilizes "the other slavery" as a broad term that includes labels that on their own are troublesome to define. The first chapter of the book covers what Reséndez refers to as the "Caribbean Debacle" (13-45), chronologically in the late 1400s: the founding of the New World. From the beginning of mass Indian enslavement, the book traverses history until the abolishment of the cruel practice in the 1880s.

Reséndez devotes the first half of *The Other Slavery* to assessing the Spanish influence on the Central-American slave trade. Beginning with Columbus and his discovery of the New World, Reséndez lays down statistics that challenge long-held beliefs concerning the interaction between the Native population and the Spanish *conquistadores*. Disease, the most devastating ravager of Native populations, did not begin dealing its damage until a full twenty-six years after Columbus's 1492 landing, reaching its apex in 1550. Reséndez speculates that, between 1492 and 1550, inhumanity toward Native populations saw "the harshest and most iniquitous and brutal slavery that any man has ever devised for oppressing his fellow-men, treating them, in fact, worse than dogs," (14) dealing out death and suffering on a massive scale. This is where we encounter Reséndez's demographic conundrum. The biological explanation for Indian devastation is squarely at odds with Spanish documentation of dealings with the Natives from Columbus's landing in 1492. The industry that Columbus, a businessman as much as navigator, had begun, caused a genocide that the Spanish Crown had not intended to bring about. Since this industry incorporated principles that were officially outlawed by the Spanish Crown, the Spanish in the

New World eventually reacted by introducing what would become known as the “New Laws,” discussed in Chapter 2 (“Good Intentions”). (46-75)

These laws, codified by Spanish activists against the reprehensible treatment of the Natives, were a sweeping attempt to reform and improve the Spanish-Indian relationship. The most important facet of the laws was attributing “free will” to the Natives, which all but illegalized slavery. The laws were well-intentioned and received well by the Native population. Yet, while the Spanish in the homeland reluctantly accepted these laws, the Spanish in the colonies reacted with outright revolt. The Central and South American slave trade was an incredibly lucrative and fundamental aspect of the economy in this massive region, and removing slavery was seen to act directly against the interests of the Crown. Thus, the “New Laws” were confounded by a lack of meaningful enforcement and subversive methods at avoiding illegality by means of terminological sophistry. These activities against the “New Laws” support the notion that these codifications were encroaching on an industry that was as complex, diverse, and powerful as it was cruel.

Reséndez’s third chapter (“The Trafficker and His Network”) (76-99) delves into the massive, web-like system that constituted the trafficking industry. Here, we see an incorporation of the African slave trade into the Central American system. Slavers in the colonies, in meticulously planned expeditions, enlisted investors to generate funds for convoy defense and employed agents who acted as middlemen for the actual sale of the slaves. One of these powerful traffickers, also known as “frontier captains,” Duarte de Leon, held connections to the larger mercantile empire of Spain, played a fundamental role during colonial wars, such as the Chichimeca Wars, and held positions of political power in the Central and South-American colonies where slavery facilitated an expansive metal mining industry.

The California Gold Rush is commonly included in lessons on strong mining industries, but the largest metal mining operations were actually the Central and South American silver excavations, discussed in Chapter 4 (“The Pull of Silver”). (100-124) These massive industries were carried out by the state-funded, coerced labor of Native populations. Silver and its associated industry provided the Spanish colonies with a massive amount of revenue at the expense of the livelihoods of millions of Indigenous slaves. Eventually, the state-driven operations of coerced labor hit a brick wall with the beginning of “The Spanish Campaign” against Native slavery (Chapter 5). (125-148) King Philip IV of Spain (ruling 1621-1640/1665), a procurer of fine arts and general advocate of worldly pleasures (125), was certainly a monarch one would not initially have expected to embark on such a mission of liberation. Yet, later in his life, hyperreligiosity inspired him to begin a campaign to liberate the Indian slaves throughout North and South America. Ultimately, some of the same constraints that had hampered the “New Laws” would plague the monarchical enforcement of Philip IV’s campaign, although the latter had more success in Trinidad and Mexico than the

previous “New Laws.” The unfortunate side effect of this governmental outlawing of slavery was that the industry was driven further under the control of Native slavers and traffickers. This became an issue because – while the Crown had had some influence over the Spanish traffickers – Native slavers were completely free from the Spanish grasp. In the end, the royal anti-slavery campaign created a precedent for future abolitionists.

At the halfway point of the book we come across “The Greatest Insurrection against the Other Slavery” (Chapter 6). (149-171) Here, the author details the massive 1680 uprising of New Mexican Pueblo Indians against the Spanish (“Pope’s Rebellion”). This revolt against the Spanish was organized, meticulous, and unforgiving. Many pueblos were destroyed by the rebels, culminating in the taking of Santa Fe. The Spanish, unprepared for the revolt, ultimately abandoned their post in Santa Fe, solidifying the Pueblo Indians’ victory over the Spanish in New Mexico which would not be reclaimed by Spain for nearly twelve years. These conflicts in the late seventeenth century altered labor relations in northern New Mexico for years to come.

The second half of Reséndez’s book focuses more on Native perspectives, as opposed to the industry-driven Spanish viewpoints emphasized in its first half. In addition, there is more emphasis on the United States’ conduct toward the Indians. Reséndez delves into the position of Indian slave holders, detailing conquests of the Utes and Comanches. Chapter 7 (“Powerful Nomads”) (172-195) underscores the importance of a new enslavement cycle in North America, headed by Natives and underpinned by the introduction of firearms and horses. This not only improved the Natives’ abilities to enslave their own kind, but, more importantly, evened the technological imbalance between the Indians and the Spanish empire, making the Natives more adept at fending off enslavement attempts. This prompted the Spanish to employ new methods of enslavement.

With the frontiers destabilized due to the rise of firearms and horses under Native control, the Spanish sent forth missionaries and established missions (Chapter 8: “Missions, Presidios, and Slaves”). (196-217) These religious stabilization efforts ultimately proved inefficient at truly controlling and coercing the Native populations to conform, as there was a relatively low number of Natives who went along. In response, Spain turned to more forceful methods in the form of *presidios*. The *presidios* were fortified bases that featured cheap or unpaid laborers, run and enforced by *presidio* soldiers. The shift from the missionary effort to the *presidio* proved violent and unforgiving to the Native population. The eventual independence movements from the Spanish governments did not abolish slavery as much as they simply replaced it with servitude. In Mexico, for example, after independence, servitude laws forbade those in servitude from leaving their masters until they had fulfilled their respective servitude obligations.

The methods of Native enslavement and disenfranchisement continued throughout the North American experience (Chapters 9-12). (218-295) The

Mexican experience with Indigenous slavery is discussed in Chapter 9, with up to 750,000 Indigenous peoples enslaved, underscoring the expansion process that was occurring in the late nineteenth century. As Mexico's expansion of slavery intensified, the United States was beginning its own experiences with "the other slavery." Reséndez explores the similarities of the sixteenth-century colonial conduct with the United States' experience, underscoring cases such as California's Indian Law of 1850, freeing Indigenous slaves but leaving subverted methods unrectified. Chapter 11 explores the "New Bondage" of Indigenous peoples under the United States government during the westward expansion through the medium of religion, as baptism and church participation were used to "civilize" the Indigenous people. The influx of European immigrants and westward-moving Americans in the nineteenth century dealt blows to the Natives in broad, devastating strokes. At long last, as detailed in Reséndez's final twelfth chapter, emancipation was on the horizon. The Civil War and the emancipation of slaves with the Thirteenth Amendment ultimately led to the abolition of Indian as well as African slavery. This did not truly come to fruition, however, until the 1880s. Reséndez ends *The Other Slavery* with a brief epilogue in which he summarizes his key findings and addresses contemporary slave movements since World War II, stating that slavery is alive and well even in the modern world.

The Other Slavery, above all else, exposes what is perhaps America's greatest tragedy. Our historical archives and popular narratives often delve into what cannot be ignored. Other popular works by authors focusing on the Indigenous American people, such as Dee Brown's *Bury My Heart at Wounded Knee* (1970) and John Ehle's *Trail of Tears: The Rise and Fall of the Cherokee Nation* (1988) are exemplary of much of the scholarship currently available. Most projects on the Indigenous experience in the Americas focus on specific tribes or tragic events, often restricted in their geographic scopes. There are works such as Charles C. Mann's *1491: New Revelations of the Americas Before Columbus* (2005) that delve into broad spheres of life in the Indigenous people's world, however, the topic of slavery is quite scarce, making Reséndez's work supremely important and impactful. The Atlantic African slave trade serves as an example rife with horror, suffering, and inhumanity that has been documented, taught, and remembered. Yet, the complete history, if such a thing is possible, of America's cultural archive has yet to be written. *The Other Slavery* is a courageous and comprehensive exposition of the tragic trafficking of Indian slaves in the New World. It is highly recommended, not just to understand Indigenous enslavement from an academic perspective, but, truly, in a human sense.

ABOUT THE REVIEWER: Raumi Majd Kinan of Orange, California, earned his B.A. in History at California State University, Fullerton (CSUF) (2018), where he is a member of the Theta-Pi Chapter of Phi Alpha Theta (History Honor Society). He is currently pursuing an M.A. in History at CSUF, working on comprehensive examinations in twentieth-century European nationalism and the dissolution of the Ottoman Empire. He also served as an editor for this volume of "The Welebaethan: A Journal of History."

Sides, Hampton.

On Desperate Ground: The Marines at the Reservoir, the Korean War's Greatest Battle.

New York: Doubleday, 2018. 416 pages. ISBN: 9780385541152.

Narrative military history has been a growing genre that enraptures the mind of even the most casual of readers and transports their imaginations to the grisly realities of war. *On Desperate Ground: The Marines at the Reservoir, the Korean's War Greatest Battle*, a book by Hampton Sides, is a recent addition to this genre. Sides is known for his narrative nonfiction histories that are usually set as adventures. His publications include *Ghost Soldiers: The Epic Account of World War II's Greatest Rescue Mission* (2001); *Blood and Thunder: An Epic of the American West* (2006); *Hellhound on His Trail: The Stalking of Martin Luther King Jr. and the International Man Hunt for His Assassin* (2010); and *In the Kingdom of Ice: The Grand and Terrible Polar Voyage of the USS Jeannette* (2014). Sides is also a journalist who serves as an editor-at-large for *Outside* magazine, and he has been a contributor to *National Geographic*. *On Desperate Ground* is Sides's latest nonfiction work and has garnered positive reviews in *The Washington Post* which named it as one of the top ten books for 2018, while the Marine Corps Heritage Foundation has named it the best nonfiction work of 2018. In addition, *On Desperate Ground* is currently under consideration to serve as the basis for a television series. I believe this book owes its overall success to the factual nature of its content which is being told as a narrative, so that readers feel like they are reading a novel, but are always reminded that the events retold in this book actually transpired. *On Desperate Ground* offers a fresh perspective on the Korean War and one of the war's most dramatic encounters, namely, the 1950 Battle at the Chosin Reservoir. Sides provides us with various accounts of the battle from a wide range of perspectives, and he explains that the Korean War and its casualties were the results of poor leadership from afar.

The book has a prologue and an epilogue with forty-five chapters in between. The chapters are further divided into five sections (or "books"). In "Book One: Seoul," we are introduced to some of the main figures of the narrative: the well-known General Douglas MacArthur, MacArthur's chief of staff Major General Edward "Ned" Almond who led the X Corps, and Major General Oliver Prince Smith who led the First Marine Division which would have a major role in the war to come. Sides emphasizes that he believes Smith is "one of the great underrated generals in American history," (9) making it apparent that Smith will play a major role in the narrative in order to highlight his achievements that, as Sides believes, are often overlooked in favor of MacArthur's. Sides uses primary sources in order to build the narrative, namely, documents found in the Marine and Army archives; he employs a number of recorded oral histories; and he has even conducted his own interviews with Chosin veterans. Sides refers to secondary sources to emphasize that the Battle at the Chosin Reservoir is one of the best-known battles of the Korean War. This may lead one to wonder whether

Sides is merely repeating a story already told, but his emphasis on Smith and his later emphasis on other individuals makes this an engaging, fact-filled narrative that will leave readers captivated.

Sides provides an excellent, if brief, history of the Korean Peninsula and how it came to be arbitrarily divided at the 38th parallel, and he explains the different political directions of the two sides: the North embraced Communism with Kim Il Sung as its leader, while the South went for democracy with President Syngman Rhee. Sides describes how Kim Il Sung invaded South Korea with a "Soviet-trained, Soviet-equipped army," (14) and although the U.S. and the U.N. sent troops to aid the South Korean soldiers, the North Korean army took Seoul and then pushed their enemies down to the southeastern tip of the Korean Peninsula at Pusan (Busan). Sides portrays MacArthur as a rash man who is into theatrics and grand schemes. Thus, it was no surprise when he introduced the idea of invading Incheon, an important port city in the middle of the Korean Peninsula, from the sea, known as "Operation Chromite." Sides introduces Almond as one of MacArthur's "yes" men who strongly supported and admired MacArthur. Almond was the leader of X Corps which was considered the main fighting force of the amphibious invasion, with the First Marine Division attached to it. Because of this arrangement, Almond was essentially Smith's boss, and their meeting became the beginning of a long-standing dislike and conflict between the two men, providing a sort of foil for Sides's main protagonist, Smith. In essence, Sides offers a revisionist history that is critical of MacArthur and Almond in order to bolster Smith. Sides also adds a Korean perspective through his own interview with Lee Bae-Suk who participated in the war, thus broadening his narrative beyond a mere American perspective. "Book One" ends with the recapturing of Seoul.

"Book Two: To the Mountains" gives us insight into the politics involved in the continuation of the Korean War, as President Harry S. Truman and his Secretary of Defense gave MacArthur free reign to go further north beyond the 38th parallel. Here, Sides also includes some Chinese history to prepare the reader for Mao Zedong and his entrance into the Korean War, which would substantially affect the tides of this war. "Book Three: The Reservoir" takes us to the beginning of the battles in North Korea, as Almond's X Corps sought to invade the North until they reached the Yalu River at the Manchurian border of China. Here, Sides steers away from his main characters and follows the personal experiences of lesser-known soldiers (who are nonetheless colorful characters). Readers now find themselves in the middle of combat, and Sides emphasizes just how hellish these battles were—from using the bodies of the fallen Chinese as cover, via soldiers fighting even though they were wounded because freezing temperatures kept them from bleeding out, to the likes of First Lieutenant John Yancey who, after an attack that had left his jaw hanging loosely, simply tied a strip of blanket to keep it in place and walked himself to the infirmary at the bottom of the mountain on which he had just fought. "Book Three" ends with

Truman finally acknowledging the magnitude of what was happening in Korea and issuing orders to pull out.

“Book Four: Red Snow” addresses the process of pulling out of Korea by first getting those at the Chosin Reservoir back to Smith’s base at Hagaru. Here, Sides again breaks away from his main protagonists, Smith, MacArthur, and Almond, and follows the narratives of lesser-known soldiers who had to pull out from the Chosin Reservoir and regroup at Hagaru. Sides describes one of the most hellish missions of the Korean War where soldiers would risk trekking across the mountains to sneak up on Chinese forces and save Fox Company (who were on the verge of being massacred) from Fox Hill at Toktong Pass. In this context, Sides acknowledges an even lesser-known soldier, a Chinese American named Chew-Een Lee, who would be the leader of a single-file column known as the Ridgerunners whose sole mission was to save Fox Company. Readers are immersed into the brutal conditions at Chosin Reservoir where, according to Sides, one of the Ridgerunners whose “spirit had gone out of him” (248) refused to march further, had to be straitjacketed and taken by stretcher, and later died to the incredulity of the soldiers even though he had no discernible injuries.

“Book Five: To The Sea” deals with the “retreat” of X Corps and the Marines. Sides mentions that the Marines did not see their march back to Hamhung as a retreat; rather, they viewed it as a “fighting retreat” or “an attack in another direction” because, as far as they were concerned, although the Chosin campaign had been a strategic disaster, they had achieved many victories, and the word “retreat” left a bad taste in their mouths. Here we see some of the Marine culture which is sprinkled throughout *On Desperate Ground* and essentially highlights the seemingly unique and proud attitude of the Marines whom Sides considers one of the best fighting forces in the world. “Book Five” blends the experiences of Sides’s main protagonists, mainly Smith, with those of lesser-known characters who share their stories of the violent and arduous march back south to Hamhung. The explicit descriptions of the horrors of war continue in “Book Five” with mentions of dead bodies used as ballast for the rebuilding of a destroyed bridge at Funchilin Pass, which was necessary for the X Corps to reach Hamhung and eventually return home. Smith is reintroduced as the main protagonist as he overlooks and admires the tenacity of his Marines, while also lamenting the casualties that he may have found unnecessary, since he had been in disagreement with MacArthur and Almond from the beginning.

Sides takes another jab at MacArthur by mentioning that the latter was not even present to greet the Marines at Hamhung, but offers some redemption to Almond for actually being present there and praising the Marines’ valor. Smith is best characterized as the main protagonist of this narrative by one of his Marines who boasted, “I’d follow him to hell because I know he’d get me out.” (326) Overall, *On Desperate Ground* provides an engaging story that mesmerizes its readers and informs them of the horrors and tribulations of war, but Sides’s overall goal is also a revisionist history. Sides speaks against the often-touted

excellence of prime figures such as MacArthur and questions the higher-ups' political command during the war. With Smith as his protagonist, Sides gives us a perspective of those who experienced firsthand the troubles of war and who actively participated and helped prevent the complete failure of the Korean campaign. Those interested in narrative military history that includes firsthand accounts will greatly enjoy this book, along with historians who can appreciate a fresh perspective on a legendary battle. Those interested in this book might be happy to know that there is now a paperback edition with a new title, *On Desperate Ground: The Epic Story of Chosin Reservoir: The Greatest Battle of the Korean War* (ISBN: 9781101971215). Those interested in further reading on the battle at the Chosin Reservoir should turn to *Breakout: the Chosin Reservoir campaign, Korea 1950* by Martin Russ (1999), *Chosin: Heroic Ordeal of the Korean War* by Eric M. Hammel (1981), *East of Chosin: Entrapment and Breakout in Korea, 1950* (1987), or *Frozen Chosin: U.S. Marines at the Changjin Reservoir* (2002). With his use of lesser-known individuals' accounts, including those of minorities, Sides provides a methodological paradigm from which to explore other battles to obtain a more comprehensive understanding of their history and legacy.

ABOUT THE REVIEWER: Erika Gabriela Victoria of Santa Fe Springs, California, earned her B.A. in History at California State University, Los Angeles (CSULA). She is currently pursuing an M.A. in History, focusing on Asian and public history, at California State University, Fullerton (CSUF), where she is a member of the Theta-Pi Chapter of Phi Alpha Theta (History Honor Society). She also served as an editor for this volume of "The Welebaethan: A Journal of History."

Solberg, Mary M., ed.

A Church Undone: Documents from the German Christian Faith Movement, 1932-1940.

Minneapolis: Fortress Press, 2015. 486 pages. ISBN: 9781451464726.

Witnessing something firsthand is a sure cure for doubt, but it might fail to remedy the aftershock of disbelief. Such is the case in *A Church Undone: Documents from the German Christian Faith Movement, 1932-1940*, selected, translated, edited, and introduced by Mary M. Solberg, a Gustavus Adolphus College emerita professor whose research includes the behavior of the Protestant church under the Third Reich, the life and thought of Dietrich Bonhoeffer, and Christian ethics. In this anthology, Solberg presents the reader with original documents from pastors, professors, and theologians who fully supported and promoted National Socialism. The documents are divided into twenty-one chapters, some containing several documents, but most consisting of one. Published between 1932 and 1937, these translated works are organized chronologically. A large majority of the authors that Solberg showcases were either sympathizers or active members of a group known as the German Christians. These Christians were not merely followers of Christ; they were "true believers [...] in Adolf Hitler." (13) Even though a minority, the German Christians had a significant influence both in the church and in society, an influence that "too few people in or out of the academy" (9) understand. This

book seeks to change this lack of awareness. It attempts to show how these Christians “encouraged attitudes and practices that now seem utterly to contradict the most basic ethical precepts of Christianity.” (11) Ultimately, this anthology is an “attempt to provide access in their own words to what the German Christians believed and thought.” (2) Solberg’s approach is to simply present one document at a time.

Each document was chosen according to Solberg’s “criteria of selection,” consisting of five components: chronology, key issues, authorship, contemporary critics, and types of documents. (27-31) Taken together, these criteria allow for a diverse collection of primary materials. The final criterion of selection, concerning types of documents, reveals the wide range of media from which these materials originated. Some pieces are excerpts from books, others are short pamphlets, still others are journal articles. Solberg also includes sources that were originally delivered as speeches and radio talks. In addition to the wide range of source types, the authors and orators are equally distinct. Although all were claiming to be Christians, many operated in different spheres of influence. Nazi-supporting clergy, professors, theologians, and even a youth pastor are among the authors of these documents. Due to this wide range of individual authors, the different pieces vary in presentation and form. While some documents are declarative, others are more explanatory. In either case, they are shocking to the modern reader.

In addition to Solberg’s method of selection, there is, it seems, an unstated process of strategic presentation. Solberg places the texts in a dynamic order, and she begins with a forceful text. Not explanatory in tone, lacking in sensible justification, and strong in delivery, laid before the reader are the 1932 “Original Guidelines of the German Christian Faith Movement” by Pastor Joachim Hossenfelder. (45) Hossenfelder begins by stating that these guidelines will “show all faithful Germans the path and the goals that will lead them to a new church order.” (48) The “Guidelines” continue, “we want a vigorous people’s church.” (49) They then turn to the issue of race: “race-mixing must be opposed” and “we reject the mission to the Jews as long as Jews have citizenship, which brings with it the danger of race-blurring and race-bastardizing.” (50) Only four pages in length, this document speaks volumes. A church for the people. A church of racial purity. What is the explanation for all of this? Solberg forces the reader into a challenging position. The document is in your face. The propaganda is proclaimed loud and clear. What are you to do with it?

The following three chapters are as difficult as the opening chapter. Solberg, using the primary sources, places the reader into the middle of a theological debate between pastors who wanted to integrate the Aryan paragraph, namely, the legal justification to dismiss Jewish Christian clergy, and those who rejected it. A document from the Theology faculty at the University of Marburg, originally signed by the Dean, Dr. Hans von Soden (who opposed the Nazis), addresses the issue. Speaking about the church body, the document states, “to

mutilate this body [i.e., the church] consciously is a sin." (62) The two strongest opponents to state measures like the Aryan paragraph were theologians Dietrich Bonhoeffer and Karl Barth. Bonhoeffer argued that the "part of the church that excludes another is, of course, the one that is truly shut out," (73) and Barth insisted, "if the German Protestant church were to exclude Jewish Christians or treat them as second-class Christians, it would have ceased to be the church." (91) Those outspoken against the Aryan paragraph were harshly criticized and excommunicated by the German Christians. "For us German Christians," declared Göttingen Theology professor Emanuel Hirsch, "there is no talking with Karl Barth." (104) Lines had been crossed, enemies made, and the German Christians firmly established themselves and opposed any dissenters.

Solberg changes pace by introducing several texts that are much more informative in tone and style. The first is a work that details the history of the movement. Its author, theologian Arnold Dannenmann, makes his intentions clear from the start: "every National Socialist is unconditionally bound to the Führer Adolf Hitler. This is not a slavish bond, but a voluntary one." (124) He continues by enthusiastically characterizing the founders of the German Christians as examples of heroism. He then explains January 30, 1933, the day Hitler became Chancellor of Germany, as a "divine hour." (146) The rise of National Socialism, according to Dannenmann, is inextricably bound to the history of the German Christians. The following chapter consists of excerpts from the "Handbook of the German Christians," a larger piece that explains the core beliefs of the movement. At one point, it declares, "the church commits itself to blood and race, for our people are a community based on blood and nature." (172) Following this, Solberg turns the reader's attention to sources that reveal problems that the German Christians faced.

The documents from Chapters 7 and 8 expose self-proclaimed challenges and struggles that the movement attempted to sort through. These documents allow the reader to see the German Christians' reasoning. The Jews were a central area of concern. According to Tübingen Theology professor Gerhard Kittel, "it thus becomes a serious question whether such radical legislation against Jews is really necessary and fair." (204) Framing this debate in "religious terms" (205), Kittel holds to a theological position that "real Judaism remains true to its symbolic being as a restless and homeless sojourner wandering the earth." (219) Kittel maintains that Jews have no home in the church. The subsequent text by Pastor Joachim Hossenfelder shows the tension between the German Christians and their enemies: Marxism and the "demonic powers of liberalism." (242) Fighting alongside Hitler, considered a model of "purity, piety, energy, and strength of character," the German Christians would help bring an end to the "Judas-bribe" that sabotaged the "German soul." (246) In order to rescue Germany, the church must "fight on behalf of race" and act readily as the "state's strong helper." (248) Justifying a theological position against the Jews while aligning themselves with

the state, these documents reveal the ideological commitments of this group. However, not everyone was aligned with these thoughts.

Although unified in their resolve against the Jews and in their full support of Hitler, the German Christians had inner conflicts that cost them many supporters. Some of the movement's members developed and promoted their views at a moderate pace and did not want to detach themselves from the general Christian public. However, other individuals, motivated by their increasing devotion to the state, tried to move things along more quickly. Reinhold Krause (who had studied the pedagogy of religion), in a "Speech at the Sports Palace in Berlin" (November 13, 1933), promoted the ideas of the German Christians to an audience of 20,000. (249) Following his speech, many Christians were unsettled by several of his comments, some of which outright denied aspects of traditional Christianity. The day after the speech, Ludwig Müller, the Reich Bishop and a leading figure in the German Christian movement, responded to Krause's speech: "the speech included an unheard-of, aggressive attack against the Old Testament, and even the New Testament was subjected to a critique that is not acceptable to the church." (265) Nonetheless, Müller's public sentiments could not rescue the movement from the repercussions of Krause's words. As a result, according to Solberg, "the movement's forward momentum [that had been maintained] throughout 1933 halted." (250) Many Christians were offended and put off by the German Christians.

In Chapters 11 through 16, Solberg offers documents that further reveal the German Christians' attempt to appeal to the wider German public. The reemerging themes that are promoted in these documents shows the movement's desire to prove its ultimate relevance to Christians, National Socialists, Hitler, and Germany as a whole. In its appeal to the wider German public, one tactic of the movement was to praise Hitler as the final fulfilment of a towering historical figure in both German and Christian history: Martin Luther. This, however, was understood differently by various authors. Pastor Friedrich Wieneke explained Hitler as the present reminder that "since Luther's time the attempt had been made to create a particularly German Christianity." (274) However, the theologian and publisher Siegfried Leffler portrayed Hitler in a different light: "without the appearance of Adolf Hitler four hundred years later, Martin Luther's act would not have fulfilled its total significance for Germany." (357) This "act" was the unification of Germany as an Aryan, Christian nation.

In the final documents of this anthology, Solberg gives the reader a taste of how these Christians understood Christ's relationship to the Jews. Traditionally, the Jews were thought to be God's Chosen People. However, with the movement's ability to reject the Old Testament and with its adherence to cultural antisemitism, Christ had to be described as an opponent of Judaism. The Organization for German Christianity argued that "one can show with the highest degree of probability that Jesus was not a Jew by blood at all." (440) It is further stated that Christ himself "recognized the two essential traits of the

satanic Jews [...] murder and lies!" (441) Theologian Walter Grundmann made similar claims, stating that "Jesus stands here in the line of ancient, foundational Aryan thought, and rejects Jewish expectations." (463) He further argued that in the person of Christ there is "something utterly un-Jewish." (469) Jesus, the founder and leader of the Christian faith, believed to be one with God, is understood and described by the German Christians as utterly opposed to the Jews, and if God was against the Jews, who could be for them?

Solberg's presentation of these original documents is provocative and insightful. However, it does not provide a clear picture of the historical development and influence of this movement. Rather, it provides the reader with pieces of history, pieces that are unified and fragmented at the same time. If a reader is interested in a book about the movement, Doris L. Bergen's work, *Twisted Cross: The German Christian Movement in the Third Reich* (1996), is a more appropriate choice. But if a reader is interested in understanding the German Christians themselves on their own terms, how they reasoned, how they justified themselves, how they believed, how they held to their convictions, and how they truly saw themselves as divinely inspired, then this is the work to consult. Regarding the events surrounding World War II, Nazi Germany, and the Holocaust, "these materials [...] surely both complicate the picture and help complete it." (2) The reader of this text will surely obtain a greater understanding of the factors that motivated this group, but the truth is disturbing. As Arnold Dannenmann proclaimed, "decades from now these things will be judged very differently from what we can see at present." (157) By simply providing the evidence, Solberg allows the reader to do just that.

ABOUT THE REVIEWER: *Isaiah Colton Thompson of Cleveland, Ohio, earned two A.A. degrees in Liberal Arts at Victor Valley College in Victorville, California (2018). He is currently pursuing a B.A. in Religious Studies and History at California State University, Fullerton (CSUF), where he is a member of the Theta-Pi Chapter of Phi Alpha Theta (History Honor Society). He is a member of the Mellon Mays Undergraduate Fellowship, the Ronald E. McNair Scholars Program, and the Sally Casanova Pre-Doctoral Scholars Program.*

Terpstra, Nicholas.

*Religious Refugees in the Early Modern World:
An Alternative History of the Reformation.*

Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2015. 358 pages. ISBN: 9781107024564.

Even before the Protestant Reformation, people were raising questions about the health of their respective spiritual communities. Early modern Europe was becoming a hotbed of new and diverse confessions and doctrines that communities of all sizes were not prepared to accommodate. In *Religious Refugees in the Early Modern World: An Alternative History of the Reformation*, Nicholas Terpstra explores the perceived threat of religious minorities within such communities and how these worries translated into public policies. Nicholas Terpstra is a professor of History at the University of Toronto. His publications center on the intersection of politics, gender, charity, and religion. Terpstra has

authored six books, with *Religious Refugees* being the latest and one of just two not written exclusively about Renaissance Italy. His previous work on the latter subject, *Cultures of Charity: Women, Politics, and the Reform of Poor Relief in Renaissance Italy* (2013), earned him awards from the Renaissance Society of America and the American Historical Association. An author so accomplished would appear to be more than ready to extend his focus to dozens of communities throughout early modern Europe. Apart from well documented examples, such as the *conversos* and *moriscos* of the Spanish Empire and the Huguenots of France, the book also takes care to examine lesser researched minorities such as the Ottoman Empire's treatment of European religions, or the unique enclosure built for the Jews in Venice.

The first of six chapters in *Religious Refugees* ("The Body of Christ: Defined and Threatened") (21-73) opens on a metaphorical concept that is key to understanding the spiritual framework of the Christian community, namely the *Corpus Christianum* or body of Christ. This framing device will appear in all parts of the book where the plight of Catholics or Protestants is concerned. Like the human body, the *Corpus Christianum* was under threat physically by the Ottoman warriors of Islam. There were also unseen threats from within, such as miasmas and plagues blamed on witches or other cohorts of the devil; the Jews who refused to convert; or iconoclast reformers. (21) Such contagions spread due to the lack of leadership from priests who should have been keeping them out. The prevailing medicine of early modern Europe consisted of purgatives rather than curatives, and this informed the communal approach to these contagions.

The next two chapters go into detail on the specific practices according to which religious minorities and refugees were treated. Chapter 2 ("Purifying the Body") (74-132) breaks these down into four categories, namely, separation, containment, prosecution, and purgation. Separation came in the form of Protestants creating their own spaces to study and practice in safety, and in the new Catholic religious orders that became popular during the fifteenth century. Containment was expressed via closed residences such as convents and monasteries for the purposes of education and improvement, but also via institutions intended to protect the outside from what was inside, such as brothels or Jewish ghettos. Prosecution encompassed more executive approaches such as Spanish inquisitors investigating heresies and enforcing pure-blood laws that, among other things, prevented converted Christians in Iberia from attending universities or marrying "Old Christians." (97) Finally, purgation included expulsion of religious minorities under governmental authority. Chapter 3 ("Dividing the Body: People and Places") (133-183) applies these four categories to the stories of individual people and places. Religious exile became a mass phenomenon in early modern Europe and continuing into the Enlightenment, so the scenarios and victims varied on a large scale. Protestant reformers valued only what was mentioned in Scripture and therefore purged the rest of the Catholic world from their communities. There was the Anabaptist

experiment of Münster where citizens were issued an ultimatum by the radical reformers who arrived there: either be re-baptized or leave. (168-169) Meanwhile, Jewish exiles in Salonika and also Protestants in Istanbul enjoyed functional coexistence with Muslims in the Ottoman Empire through the latter's *millet* system governing religious communities. (157-160) Examples like these illustrate that refugees shaped environments just as much as their own situation was shaped by the world that rejected them.

The fourth chapter ("Mind and Body") (184-240) is all about comparative practices among Christians, Jews, and Muslims. The rituals and rules that most tangibly divided them pertained to three themes: initiation, presence, and authority. The initiation rituals of circumcision and baptism created boundaries between faiths, while the presence of God in the sacrament of Communion was re-evaluated by Protestants who allowed the laity to sip wine from the Communion cup as only Priests were expected to in Catholicism. Finally, the question of authority was the primary focus of the rift between Catholics and Protestants: Who or what speaks for God? Protestants of all stripes venerated the idea of *sola scriptura* (by Scripture alone), but the Bible was anything but straightforward, and questions of what books should be considered part of the canon challenged the very notion that the laity could handle Scripture in a direct, non-curated format. (213-214) Beyond these themes, Terpstra asks how notions of charity evolved during the Reformation. Charitable works had been emphasized by Christians, Jews, and Muslims alike during the Middle Ages, but in early modern Europe the goal for Christians was to improve the spirit and provide character-building discipline as much as relief. Protestant schools and Catholic religious orders waged their wars of influence accordingly. (226-227) The Islamic and Jewish worlds also expanded their relief efforts via *waqfs* (endowments) and local relief efforts respectively. These examples demonstrate that the obligation to provide charity was recognized across all faiths even if the methods were not mirrored. (221-222)

The fifth chapter ("Re-Forming the Body: The World the Refugees Made") (241-308) reads like many other academic books about the Reformation as Terpstra describes the religious world(s) created by the refugees. Every innovation from the printing press to the catechism gets its mention here before ending in a discussion on "confessionalization." What keeps this chapter from feeling derivative are the connections drawn between these old talking points and the themes of Chapters 2 and 4. For instance, the majority of printed material at the dawn of Luther's Reformation came in the form of 16-32-page pamphlets because these were cheaper to produce and helped printers maximize their profits in a world where ten percent or less of the German population could even read. The writers of these works, Luther included, were diligently working to sell a narrative of purgation which festered and boiled into the disastrous German Peasants' Revolt of the mid-1520s. (246-247) The theme of separation reared its head when Protestant clerical standards suggested that priests be trained outside

of their communities from adolescence to read the scriptures in Greek and Hebrew. (262) Renovations of church spaces in the early modern era focused on the presence of God. Protestant church spaces removed altar pieces and statues while emphasizing the pulpit. Catholic churches were constructed on larger scales and adorned with more fabulous, commissioned artwork to inspire worshippers. Jews could not create their own sacred spaces, as they were denied the practice of crafts like carpentry or construction by early modern civil laws, but they could still contract non-Jewish builders to do it for them in places of greater toleration. (284) The mosques of the Ottoman Empire had a hybridized style as they moved into Eastern Orthodox Europe. All of these places of worship were publicly visible markers of religious identity, but that also made them easy targets for violence intended to “purify.” (288)

The concluding chapter (“Re-Imagining the Body”) (309-329) opens on the Yugoslav Wars (1991-2001) which, while not events in early modern history, can still be described according to Terpstra’s framework of purgation and exile. The ethnic cleansing of Catholic Croats and Bosnian Muslims came at the behest of military leaders who were calling for extermination and the destruction of places of worship. And this bloody war was not alone in such rhetoric, considering the Balkan Wars, the Armenian Genocide, the Ukrainian Holodomor, and the Holocaust. As if the connection between the early modern world and the twentieth century could not get any more overt, Martin Luther’s treatise “About the Jews and Their Lies” (1543) was reprinted as part of Nazi propaganda. (311) The final pages of Terpstra’s book affirm that practical co-religious existence did occur in early modern Europe but that obstacles to toleration were becoming systematic. Religion became more about dogmas, definitions, and doctrines, and confessionalization turned religious fears and questions into political action.

One major critique I have is the total lack of footnote or endnote citations, and that there is only a selective bibliography organized by chapters. It can be frustrating for the reader to learn of a unique example of Reformation society only to have no source to learn more. Terpstra’s previous works do not exclude sources in this way, so this decision was likely made by the publisher in order to sell *Religious Refugees* to a more general readership presumably intimidated by footnotes. Even so, that common concern usually results in footnotes becoming endnotes, rather than total exclusion. Perhaps publishing concessions needed to be made in order for *Religious Refugees* to join several dozen other works of nonfiction attempting to hit the market in time for the five-hundredth anniversary of the Reformation. Or perhaps the publisher simply put their foot down on a page count maximum in order to keep costs low. If that last possibility were the case, the author would have had to weigh the wide scope of the book over the inclusion of citations, which is a difficult call to make.

Is *Religious Refugees* an “alternative history” as the subtitle claims? Terpstra explains that the historiography of the Reformation has classically followed the stories of individual reformers because other commentaries on the spiritual or

intellectual progression of this era can vary widely based on authors' personal values or even nationalities. Even as Reformation historiography has shifted from the stories of great men to analyses of other topics, such as women or the poor, our understanding of the period has been deepened, yet our framework has remained unchallenged. New interpretations and narratives have absorbed the old ones, but not overturned them. (8) I believe this is why Terpstra cites the expulsion of 80,000 Jews from Spain in 1492 as the earliest incident of the Reformation. (2) Other authors may be content with picking another radical thinker, such as Jan Hus or Hans Behem, to take the place of Martin Luther and his "Ninety-Five Theses" as the agents who started everything, but they are then still entertaining the old notion that individual "great men" are the causes of history. Terpstra even goes so far as to call out the Martin Luther narrative as a "North European conceit". (329) But the strongest case for Terpstra breaking ground in the field is the large scope of the book. By including Jewish and Muslim histories, Terpstra challenges the antiquated notion that the Reformation is an era concerned only with a rift in Western Christendom.

Terpstra's approach to refugees and the methods or language of exclusion provides a new framework for analyzing this period of history in a context more stimulating to the modern historian. It is true that the early modern era did not create the first religious refugees, but the persecution started to escalate into a mass phenomenon only comparable to later eras. One must understand, though, that the pre-Enlightenment concept of "religious tolerance" was different from our own. Our notion of the term "tolerance" is that tolerance is positive, progressive, respectful, and accommodating. Meanwhile, to the early modern spiritual body, tolerance was negative, a sign of weakness, and associated with the act of suffering or enduring the existence of the religious other. Religious diversity was becoming a political issue that needed to be solved. (120) Tolerance may have been practiced at local levels of government. In such cases, a threat to the community may be pointed out, yet the authorities lacked the willpower or incentive to do something about it. However, as long as the discourse persisted and became more accessible through vernacular pamphlets and in written law, new generations would be born into the language of purgation and purity and have fewer misgivings about making good on those threats. (74)

Comprehensive studies like *Religious Refugees* do not appear often and are just as rarely this readable. One that comes to mind is Benjamin Kaplan's *Divided By Faith: Religious Conflict and the Practice of Toleration in Early Modern Europe* (2007), which is a similarly broad study on early modern notions of religious tolerance and the various ways in which religious minorities were treated. Terpstra's book, however, should suffice in fascinating general readers and can potentially challenge long-held ideas about Reformation history, which is the standard by which I recommend it.

ABOUT THE REVIEWER: Glenn Patrick Doherty of Santa Ana, California, earned his A.A. (for transfer) at Santiago Canyon College in Orange, California (2017). He is currently pursuing a B.A. in History at California State University, Fullerton (CSUF).

Tortorici, Zeb.

Sins against Nature: Sex and Archives in Colonial New Spain.

Durham: Duke University Press, 2018. 344 pages. ISBN: 9780822371540.

Warning: Graphic sexual depictions. Archives are the backbones of historical studies, and, as Zeb Tortorici demonstrates, they even provide glimpses into the sexual history of colonial New Spain via the Inquisition and other records featuring sodomy, necrophilia, bestiality, sex with the “divine,” and sexual abuse by church figures. Tortorici’s *Sins against Nature: Sex and Archives in Colonial New Spain* takes cultural history to a new level. Tortorici employs archival sources from colonial New Spain, from 1535 to 1821, to study the accounts of “sins against nature,” provides insights into the sexual history of colonial New Spain, and assesses the respective effects on individuals and communities. New Spain, or *Nuevo España*, for Tortorici comprises “Mexico, Central America, Florida, much of the southwestern and central United States, and the Carribbean,” (2) and eventually (since 1565) the Spanish East Indies. Tortorici suggests that historians should perhaps question their methods when using the archives, especially when exploring sexual history. Zeb Tortorici is an associate professor of Spanish and Portuguese at New York University whose edited collections include *Sexuality and the Unnatural in Colonial Latin America* (2016). Tortorici’s new book, which is the subject of this review, adds to the history of colonial New Spain by exploring archival evidence for “sins against nature,” but his primary goal is to understand archival processes and how one can gain a more profound understanding of the social and cultural history of a much-studied society.

Tortorici’s monograph consists of an introduction, conclusion, and six chapters in between. Tortorici begins his introduction by challenging historians to explore local archives to study sexual history, rather than rely on national or regional archives. He emphasizes that viewing sexuality as something between male and female limits what one can discover of a culture’s sexual history. His first chapter explains the different ways in which a visceral reaction can manifest itself. Based on his theories of how one may explore the archives, he explains that there are several stages of the visceral: first, the visceral affects the witness or witnesses and their testimony; then it affects the transcriber of said testimony which goes on to affect the cataloger or archivist of the respective primary document; finally, the visceral affects those who pull up an archival source, such as Tortorici himself. Using examples of sodomy cases, Tortorici explores this phenomenon. One can, of course, read these examples as cultural or social history, but Tortorici examines how eyewitnesses and the courts came to deal with these instances in order to define the visceral and how it affects our understanding of the archives and of history. Those unfamiliar with historical

methodology may find all this a little too theoretical, but that does not make it any less relevant.

In Chapter 2, while examining cases of sodomy, Tortorici covers the visceral reactions associated with these documents, but he also delves into the problems of misinscription and silences in the archives. Those who transcribed the eyewitnesses' or accused's testimonies had issues with misinscriptions since some cases involved the Indigenous people of colonial New Spain, and because these spoke their own languages, one had to rely on translators to acquire their testimonies. Thus, transcriptions of these translations can be replete with errors, and their original meanings may be lost since there may not have been an equivalent word or phrase in Spanish that properly illustrated what an eyewitness or accused was trying to relate. Tortorici also tackles the issue of silences. He indicates that certain cases appear to not have been well documented to begin with, or that the conclusions of certain cases are either missing or perhaps never existed. Tortorici's discussion of topics like the visceral, misinscriptions, and silences challenges scholars to rethink their methods when reading archival sources. With these concepts in mind, Tortorici goes on, in Chapter 3, to explore more of the culture of colonial New Spain by addressing voyeurism and gestures in the sodomy cases, all the while making sure that readers are aware of the respective archival processes. Tortorici explains how sodomy was defined in colonial New Spain, and how courts judged and punished sodomy according to their Catholic beliefs.

In Chapter 4, Tortorici turns to cases involving bestiality. He recreates the case of one Pedro Na who was accused of having "carnal access" (124) with a turkey. Pedro was found guilty and forced to be publicly shamed by riding on the back of a "saddled animal," (125) while a town crier announced his "crimes." Pedro was then publicly castrated and banished from the provinces of Yucatán. However, what stood out most prominently to Tortorici was the fact that the turkey, which had died due to the sexual acts inflicted upon it, was hung from Pedro's neck while he was publicly shamed and that, at the end of the punishment, the turkey was burned to ashes. This ties into Tortorici's interest in animal history which he feels has been a neglected subject in the study of history and has suffered erasure, much like the turkey being turned to ashes. Tortorici believes that animals have their own agency and that they, even though they are not able to communicate verbally, nonetheless occupy areas of history and play significant roles that should be explored. Studying animal history, along with its erasure, can provide different perspectives from which we can explore certain cultures, and, in the case of Pedro Na, they offer a meaningful example since the turkey is one of the native birds of the Yucatán and thus an integral part of this region's cultural history. Those with weak stomachs may have a difficult time reading Tortorici's analysis of bestiality cases, but it is clear that we have yet a lot to learn from animal history and its implications for cultures around the world.

Tortorici ends his book by looking into the influence of the church and religion when it comes to the sexual history of colonial New Spain. In Chapter 5, we encounter cases of church figures soliciting sexual favors in the confessional or performing “sins against nature,” such as sodomy, outside of their church services. Tortorici in chapter six also explores what he refers to as sexual acts with the “divine,” as there were those who claimed to have had sexual encounters with divine figures or the Virgin Mary. In the cases of those who claimed to have committed “sins against nature” with divine figures, many cases ended with the accused being labeled as having an “‘illness of heart’, melancholy, dementia, fatuousness, locura or ‘craziness’, and other unspecified ‘sicknesses’ of body and soul.” (227-228) Tortorici’s study of these cases allows for an archival shift since many of these cases used to be viewed from a medical perspective rather than a religious one, thus reemphasizing Tortorici’s challenge that we need to examine how we interact with the archives.

Regarding the soliciting of sexual favors in Chapter 5, these cases were seen as instances of favoritism or leniency. Due to the prominence of religion in this region, church figures occupied a higher status than average citizens, let alone the Indigenous. Tortorici delves into the trouble of archiving confessionals, and even though soliciting women was an issue, Tortorici’s main focus is on the solicitation of males, especially young males. His approach to this subject is a backhanded criticism of how sexual abuse of young males has been handled in modern-day Catholic churches. Studying how these cases were archived provides insights into the culture of the respective time period during which these cases never saw much punishment besides accusations of “light suspicion of heresy.” (167) Elements of linguistics, which delve into the social history of this region, furnish us with additional tools to explore cultural history and reexamine our interaction with the archives.

Tortorici’s conclusion sums up his main findings, reminding readers what one must be wary of when delving into the archives since historians have an ethical responsibility to explore all avenues of historical research. Those interested in Tortorici’s historical methodology may wish to turn to such works as *Archive Stories: Facts, Fictions, and the Writing of History* by Antoinette Burton (2005), *Into the Archive: Writing and Power in Colonial Peru* by Kathryn Burns (2010), or *The Allure of the Archives* by Arlette Farge (2013). Those interested in the history of sexuality in Spain or colonial New Spain are advised to consult *Sexual Hierarchies, Public Status: Men, Sodomy, and Society in Spain’s Golden Age* by Cristian Berco (2007), *Butterflies Will Burn: Prosecuting Sodomites in Early Modern Spain and Mexico* by Federico Garza Carvajal (2003), or *Sexo y confesión: La iglesia y la penitencia en los siglos XVIII y XIX en la Nueva España* by Jorge René González Marmolejo (2002). *Sins against Nature: Sex and Archives in Colonial New Spain* is aimed at historians, especially historians with knowledge of historical theories and methodologies, and as such may be less accessible to amateur historians or those with a general interest in the history of colonial New Spain. Those devoted

to archival work will certainly relate to Tortorici's intimate relationship with the archives.

ABOUT THE REVIEWER: *Erika Gabriela Victoria of Santa Fe Springs, California, earned her B.A. in History at California State University, Los Angeles (CSULA). She is currently pursuing an M.A. in History, focusing on Asian and public history, at California State University, Fullerton (CSUF), where she is a member of the Theta-Pi Chapter of Phi Alpha Theta (History Honor Society). She also served as an editor for this volume of "The Welebaethan: A Journal of History."*

Wallace, Patrick F.

Viking Dublin: The Wood Quay Excavations.

Sallins: Irish Academic Press, 2016. 594 pages. ISBN: 9780716533146.

In *Viking Dublin: The Wood Quay Excavations*, Patrick F. Wallace presents the various discoveries of the Wood Quay/Fishamble Street excavations, conducted in Dublin in the 1970s and 1980s. These excavations were led by Wallace himself as chief archaeologist, and after the excavations ended, in 1988, Wallace was appointed Director of the National Museum of Ireland. It is Wallace's intent to convey what Dublin was like as a town during its first four centuries (ninth-twelfth centuries CE) by presenting both the historical record and the archaeological evidence from Ireland and abroad. (x-xi) The wide range of archaeological evidence found in Dublin is an obvious source of pride for Wallace who repeatedly emphasizes that Dublin has some of the most complete archaeological evidence for a Viking town anywhere in Europe. There are other works on Viking-era Dublin and the Wood Quay excavations, including *Viking Dublin Exposed: The Wood Quay Saga*, released in 1984 with John Bradley as editor, and *Wood Quay: The Clash Over Dublin's Viking Past*, published in 1988 by Thomas Farel Heffernan and focusing on the efforts to preserve the excavation site.

Archaeological findings play a significant role in Wallace's presentation. While the book's introduction provides some historical context to the excavations, most of what is being presented in the subsequent thirteen chapters amounts to evidence overload. Chapter 1, "Origins, Evidence, and Sites," is most concerned with the history of the city of Dublin, including evidence that predates Dublin's settlement by the Vikings. This chapter already presents the reader with a plethora of numbers and data (3), a taste of what is to follow, and with a comparison between Dublin and other areas occupied by the Vikings, notably York. (7) Wallace stresses here, for the first of many times, how well preserved the archaeological evidence is. (17) Chapter 2, "Town Layout: Yards, Neighborhoods, Successions, Maps, and Reconstruction," showcases what the archaeological evidence suggests regarding Dublin's physical layout during this period and includes a site-by-site description. (33-47) Wallace argues that the Wood Quay/Fishamble Street excavations provide great insight into period town layout. (48) The remainder of this chapter describes the layout of the yards and provides a reconstruction of these yards. (53, 57-58) This reconstruction is perhaps Chapter 2's best feature and gives the reader a good idea of what the

town may have looked like. In Chapter 3, "Buildings," Wallace turns to the various buildings identified during the excavations. According to the author, some 600 buildings (both complete and fragmentary) were found, which would be a rather complete set in the history of early medieval Europe. (76) Wallace describes the various types of buildings (79). His reconstructions and models are immensely helpful to understand the various buildings' designs. (87-90) This chapter contains images of roof and floor tiles (103), as well as examples of wooden drains found during the excavations. (112-113)

Chapter 4, "'A Wonder of Ireland': The Viking and Hiberno-Scandinavian Port," focuses on the Vikings' efforts to provide military defenses for the port of Dublin, since they were less concerned with trade and more with protecting the city itself. The chapter starts by discussing three of several banks (fortifications) found during the excavations. Supported by detailed photographs, Wallace shows the development from boulder-clay banks to stone walls. (125-142) The remainder of the chapter turns to weapons found during the excavations, namely those considered to be of Viking origin or at least inspired by the Vikings (but in some cases imported from the Baltic region), once again supplemented by numerous photographs, including those of arrowheads and spearheads. (143-150) The chapter ends with a discussion concerning the governance of Dublin during its Viking occupation. Chapter 5, "The Hiberno-Norman Port: Revetment, Engineering, and Ships," addresses the defensive properties of Viking Dublin's port, the trade activities in that port after the Norman invasion, and how, during the twelfth and thirteenth centuries, the port became more open to ships and trade. (154) It includes a reconstruction drawing by Michael Heffernan of what the Hiberno-Norman port might have looked like. (155) This chapter explains that the revetments (fortifications) found during the excavations offered stability for an embankment. (157-168) Another topic covered in Chapter 5 is the timber used for shipbuilding. The various parts of different ships found during the excavations include some well-preserved planking which most likely belonged to a late twelfth-century ship. (183) There are fascinating images of a "mast crutch" and a "wooden flax beater" (186), as well as the picture of a replica ship named "Roar Egge." (191)

Following Chapter 6, "Environment, Hinterland, and People," Wallace turns to material culture which is the topic of Chapters 7 through 11. Chapter 7, "Wood, Leather, and Textiles," concerns itself with wood craftsmanship and carpentry. One of the more mysterious objects found during the excavations is a furniture piece that includes various incredibly detailed "animal-headed handles." (252) The leather works discovered range from shoes to bags and are of relatively good quality. (259-260) The evidence for textile production ranges from silk and wool-textile fragments to the numerous tools for the manufacturing of textiles. (262-268) The discussion on leather goods and textiles continues in Chapter 8, "Dress, Personal Ornament, and Related Crafts." Here, Wallace speculates on the usage of various items, notably how items such as head

coverings might have been worn, with a series of illustrations showcasing several possible ways. (274) There are silk and woolen scarves that give the reader an idea of how the head coverings may have appeared. (272) Braids and ribbons are among the items commonly found in Dublin, with more than forty silk ribbons among the discoveries. (275) Personal ornaments were made from a wide range of materials, including copper, lead, glass, and amber. (279) The chapter features examples of brooches, buckles, and tags. (279-284) The beads and the amulets made from amber and beads are beautiful and showcase the craftsmen's attention of detail. (289, 294-295) There are also objects made from bone and ivory, including needles, pins, whistles, and motif pieces. (303-304)

Chapter 9, "Ferrous and Non-Ferrous Metal," discusses the numerous metal objects discovered in Dublin. Wallace speculates that blacksmiths were among the most valued artisans in Viking Dublin. (310) He lists the types of metalwork they created for professional and domestic settings. It appears that the tools used by woodworkers, stoneworkers, and possibly clothworkers and leatherworkers were made from the same materials; specifically, hammers, axes, saws, and tongs were made from iron. (312-316) The excavations also yielded numerous household items, such as knives, spoons, and forks, (319) as well as items intended for use with horses, such as prick spurs and stirrups. (325) Iron was often used in tandem with copper, silver, and gold, with copper-based evidence being the most common. Lead was also prevalent and used for weights, spindle whorls, and pendant crosses. (335, 339-342)

Chapter 10, "The Wealth of Barbarians': Silver, Coins, Weights, and Commodities," discusses the amount of silver found in Ireland, particularly the different coins (of which there are many) and their various designs. (354-357) Weights were typically made from lead or copper (and very impressive). (361) This chapter also reviews evidence of imports, including walnuts, plums, amber, ivory, pottery, glass, and disc brooches, as proof of long-distance trade. (365-368) Disc brooches and both unworked and finished pieces of amber appear to be of German origin. (369-370) Chapter 11, "The Archaeology of Art, Leisure, Literacy, and Belief," covers items located during the excavations that are considered to have been of domestic or religious use. In this chapter, Wallace explains the influence that Viking art had on art in Dublin, specifically, that the *Ringerike* (Oslo) school of art influenced the Irish the most, which can be seen in the animal-like patterns carved on wooden handles. (387-389) With regard to stone and bone motifs, Wallace theorizes that stone motifs started in Ireland and then spread to other regions of Europe, (393) subsequently mixing with West-Norse metalwork designs. The excavations also yielded examples of craft items used for domestic purposes, such as a wooden toy sword, toy boat, and dog figurine, (405,407) as well as game pieces made from bone and stone. (406)

Chapter 12, "Archaeology, History and Relative Ethnicity," and Chapter 13, "The Archaeology of Early Medieval Dublin: Context and Significance," summarize Wallace's interpretations of the evidence discovered during the

Wood Quay/Fishamble Street excavations and their broader historical implications. Patrick F. Wallace's *Viking Dublin: The Wood Quay Excavations* is a well-written and well-researched piece of scholarship. One of the book's primary advantages are its numerous pictures, reconstructions, and models of objects found during the excavations, which are invaluable for any reader unfamiliar with either the subject matter or the way the information is presented in the text. Undoubtedly, *Viking Dublin* will be of value to those interested in archaeology and anthropology; to the general reader, it is perhaps less accessible. Overall, I am certainly inclined to agree with the author's enthusiastic assessment of his Wood Quay/Fishamble Street excavations and their significance for our understanding of Viking and Irish history.

ABOUT THE REVIEWER: Shannon Deana Landreth of Fontana, California, earned her A.A. in History at Chaffey College in Rancho Cucamonga, California (2013), her B.A. in History at California State University, San Bernardino (CSUSB) (2015), and her M.A. in History at California State University, Fullerton (CSUF) (2020).

Walpole, Garth.

Relics of the Franklin Expedition:

Discovering Artifacts from the Doomed Arctic Voyage of 1845. Edited by Russell Potter.

Jefferson: McFarland & Company, 2017. 240 pages. ISBN: 9781476667188.

Tragedies and mysteries, while often difficult to process, have always been popular topics among scholars and the general public. Imaginations run wild, attempting to explain what may (or may not) have occurred. One such mystery captured the attention of Garth Walpole, an Australian historian and archaeologist, and Russell Potter, an American writer and college professor, who dedicated their lives to studying the 1845 disappearance of Sir John Franklin's failed expedition to find the Northwest Passage. Instead of finding a faster route to Asia, Franklin and his entire crew were lost, with only a handful of relics of their voyage remaining. Garth Walpole's and Russell Potter's work *Relics of the Franklin Expedition: Discovering Artifacts from the Doomed Arctic Voyage of 1845* subverts readers' expectations with regard to this mystery in a clever and compelling way. The historiography of polar exploration (meaning expeditions to both the Arctic and Antarctic) is dominated by works focused on the themes of heroism, ecological preservation, and legitimacy over the discovery of geographic locations. Scholars have produced a number of works exploring how and why Franklin's expedition disappeared, including the recently published *Frozen in Time: The Fate of the Franklin Expedition* by Owen Beattie and John Geiger (2017) and *Death in the Ice: The Mystery of the Franklin Expedition* by Karen Ryan (2018). Instead of devoting their work to the disappearance of the expedition, as other scholars have done, Walpole and Potter thoroughly examine the subsequent missions by the British Royal Navy to find traces of Franklin's crew and the relics which they were able to recover. An in-depth analysis of these

relics, their discovery, preservation, and economic value (both then and now) accompanies this process.

Walpole and Potter begin by offering readers a brief overview of the Franklin Expedition and its mission, namely, to find the legendary Northwest Passage. However, Walpole is quick to note that this will not serve as the focus of this present work: "As part of an examination of these relics [i.e., the relics recovered from the Franklin Expedition], I will address their significance as objects. These objects shared a biography or 'life history,' and like the men were created (born), used (lived) and lost or discarded (died)." (3) For Walpole, these objects served as living examples of the harsh conditions and possible misfortunes that must have befallen the crew. They are living history: "It is my aim, through a close, careful analysis of these relics, to better understand their significance and place in terms of the wider context of material culture studies." (3) By employing a methodology focused on the material remains of the expeditions, Walpole and Potter are able to demonstrate how their archaeological and journalistic backgrounds compliment their historical analyses of the artifacts.

Relics of the Franklin Expedition consists of six chapters, each focusing on the "lifetime" of the discovered relics. It is important to note, however, that these chapters are not equal in length or weight, with the second chapter ("The Continued Search for Relics, 1851-1854") encompassing almost half of the book. (50-149) Conversely, the fourth chapter ("The Material and Social Value of the Relics") is disappointingly short. (160-162) Walpole's methodology is easy to follow, given that there is a clear focus on the relics, and the book proceeds both chronologically and thematically as it explores various aspects of the expedition's economic, political, scientific, and even environmental impacts. Moreover, instead of building their analysis on the works of previous Arctic and British historians, Walpole and Potter emphasize archaeological monographs which inspired them, including Igor Kopytoff's *The Cultural Biography of Things: Commoditization as Process* (1986). (3-4)

Chapter 1 ("The Material Biography of Relics: A Physical and Spiritual Relationship") takes into account the lack of historical scholarship dedicated to examining how people have interacted with material objects, with Walpole explaining that "[i]n Western thought, objects and people have always been distinctly separate." (5) Walpole insists that for readers to understand the significance of the surviving relics of the Franklin Expedition they must look beyond the traditional meaning that relics hold in Western thought. In the eyes of the authors, "any relic of the dead is precious, [especially] if they were valued living." (7) Walpole and Potter then offer readers a taste of what the rest of the work will be like, with maps, illustrations, and detailed descriptions of objects related to the expedition which were recovered by subsequent search parties. (9-49) Not all of these objects are what one would traditionally expect to find, with campsites, fortifications, and the remains of makeshift huts serving as arguably the most relevant remains available to historians and archaeologists interested in

unraveling what may have happened to the ships and crew. (21-25) Overall, this chapter creates a strong foundation for the remainder of the work.

Chapter 2 ("The Continued Search for Relics, 1851-1854") serves as the main course of the text and follows the history of five expeditions made by both the Royal Navy and the surviving families of those lost during the Franklin Expedition. (50-149) Frustratingly, this chapter is probably too technical for the wider reading public. At first, it seems promising. It presents a map of northern Canada, which indicates the paths taken by both Franklin's expedition and those who came looking for them. (54) Discoveries made by the crews of the *Investigator* and the *Enterprise* (ships under the command of Lt. Collinson in 1852 and 1853) soon follow, and Walpole thoroughly examines these relics, which include an anchor, a section of hatchway, and crudely made living quarters on a small Arctic beach. (55-59) Next, Walpole discusses the Anderson Expedition of June 1853, which recovered Franklin's diary (i.e., the Hudson Bay diary). (59)

Walpole presents these expeditions in chronological order, and he repeatedly mentions that they largely occurred as a result of surviving family members securing enough financial support to initiate them. (50-67) Considering the recovery of Franklin's diary, one would think that his words may have offered at least some closure to the families of those who had disappeared, however, Walpole and Potter never reveal these families' reactions to the various discoveries, which will leave most readers disappointed. It is clear from the extent and structure of the second chapter that this book was written almost exclusively for archaeologists interested in the relationship between relics and people. For historians, it is valuable because it demonstrates how to construct an interdisciplinary approach to a complex subject, but it falls short in that it is written for such a comparatively small audience. Historians do their best when they tell stories about the past for others to learn about the human experience. Little information about the lives of those of the past can be gained from this text; rather, there is only familiarity with the relics themselves. The last three chapters of the book, "Examining the Relics," "The Material and Social Value of the Relics," "The Relics: Their Past, Present and Future," relate where the recovered relics found their new homes (in museums, archives, and private collections), and how twenty-first-century scholars have interpreted their significance to the archaeological community. (145-190) The sheer skill needed to so accurately trace the movement of so many artifacts is truly astounding and demonstrates Walpole's scholarly prowess.

Tragically, Walpole passed away in 2015, soon after the completion of this text. He had spent numerous years meticulously crafting it to what he viewed as perfection. Potter, who had partnered with Walpole in his research efforts, collaborated with Walpole's colleagues in Tasmania to ensure the text's accuracy and then saw the work through to publication in 2017. Potter served as the book's editor, though, according to multiple interviews, he prefers to be referenced as Walpole's co-author. Potter dedicated the introduction and a

portion of the work's conclusion to Walpole and his legacy. (1-4, 191-194) *Relics of the Franklin Expedition* is well structured, and it provides readers with detailed information on the history of the relics associated with the Franklin Expedition, as well as an account of the subsequent expeditions intended to find potential clues and survivors. Walpole and Potter establish their work in the context of relevant scholarship and offer a well-meaning, if potentially confusing, interdisciplinary approach to their research. Instead of attempting to do the impossible by endlessly theorizing what may have happened to Franklin and his crew, Walpole and Potter give readers tangible evidence of the past and do their best to relate it. However, they admit that, despite their best efforts, "the study of these relics from their deposition, to our present understanding is, like the objects themselves, malleable and not complete." (192)

ABOUT THE REVIEWER: Christopher Dean Robbins of Brea, California, earned his B.A. in History at California State University, Fullerton (CSUF) (2018), where he is a member and former vice president of the Theta-Pi Chapter of Phi Alpha Theta (History Honor Society). He is currently pursuing an M.A. in History at CSUF, focusing on the history of Spiritualism in Victorian England and North America.

Zahra, Tara.

The Great Departure:

Mass Migration from Eastern Europe and the Making of the Free World.

New York: W.W. Norton & Company, 2017; first published 2016. 416 pages. ISBN: 9780393353723.

"The Great Departure from Eastern Europe helped to define the 'free world' in the twentieth century," (21) writes Tara Zahra in her new monograph, *The Great Departure: Mass Migration from Eastern Europe and the Making of the Free World*. What concept of "freedom" is she referencing? Zahra diversifies the traditional U.S.-centric narrative of Eastern European immigration by examining the reasons for this movement of Eastern Europeans to the United States from the 1880s onward. In doing so, she presents two prominent divergences from the traditional story: the first is that immigrants often came reluctantly, seeing the United States as a desperate final option rather than a beacon of hope; the second is that immigration trends were as influenced by the policies of Eastern European nations as they were by the policies of the United States. Zahra illuminates her analysis of broad population trends with stories of individual immigrants. It is among many monographs about transnational history to appear in recent years, including Ana Elizabeth Rosas's *Abrazando el Espiritu: Bracero Families Confront the U.S Mexico Border* (2018), and Erica Lee's *The Making of Asian America* (2016).

Tara Zahra is a professor of European History at the University of Chicago. Her previous works have focused on transnational history, migration and nationalism. She explores each of these themes in *The Great Departure*, portraying the migration of various European peoples to the United States in the face of opposition or encouragement from highly nationalistic governments. The first chapter deals with efforts by the governments of Central and Eastern European

countries to discourage emigration by limiting pro-emigration propaganda. The immigration policies of these nation-states often encouraged the emigration of ethnic minorities, while discouraging the departure of members of the dominant ethnic group. This pattern was continued by the new nation-states that emerged following World War I. Zahra draws a connection from these early nationalist efforts to control borders to the eventual complete restriction of movement under the communist and fascist regimes of the twentieth century.

Zahra also explores the relationship between freedom of movement and the concept of freedom in American rhetoric. In the introduction, she points out that freedom in the United States has always included this concept as exemplified by the ability of settlers to move westward. Whereas the pre-capitalist mercantile states of early modern Europe had sought to bolster their populations, Malthusian pessimism concerning overpopulation had by the nineteenth century convinced European governments to embrace the liberal concept of freedom of movement. Eventually, the governments of Cold War-era eastern bloc countries that closed their borders argued that emigration would lead to a restriction of freedom due to wage slavery, whereas remaining would ensure freedom from exploitation.

The first portion of the book focuses on emigration from Austria-Hungary in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. It opens with the trial of sixty-five travel agents in the Galician town of Wadowice, then part of the Austro-Hungarian empire, now part of Poland. They were accused of deceiving citizens of the Habsburg empire into migrating by promising them false conditions upon their arrival to the United States. Zahra portrays this trial as an example of the policies of the Austro-Hungarian government to restrict emigration. Citizens of the dual monarchy gained the constitutional right of free movement in 1867. However, this right was seldom recognized in practice as local authorities often intimidated locals from taking the steps necessary to emigrate. Nevertheless, between 1876 and 1900, over three million people left the empire, a figure that astounded local authorities. Members of the military establishment were alarmed over the loss of potential conscripts. Religious and political authorities, as well as reformers, saw the departures as symptomatic of poverty, underemployment, and imperial decline. Zahra affirms this critique, arguing that escaping poverty was the primary motivator for emigration, especially in the province of Galicia. Meanwhile, she acknowledges that some individuals may have emigrated for more personal reasons than just the desire to escape.

Travel agents were blamed for the mass departures. Often, they were assumed to be Jewish, and their promotion of emigration was portrayed as a Jewish conspiracy to undermine the nation-state. The Wadowice trial saw the use of traditional anti-Semitic rhetoric by the prosecution, which achieved conviction and prison sentences for the travel agents. This exemplified the Hungarian government's (which was largely independent of Austria with regard to

domestic affairs) uniquely severe restrictions on emigration. Policies like these would serve as examples to post-World War I nation-states. (23-63)

Zahra examines how European states shaped migration policies to maintain their respective nations' self-perception as white. The second chapter begins with Booker T. Washington's and sociologist Robert Park's 1910 journey through Europe to find "the farthest man down" or the people at the lowest point of European society. They observed that the Slavic peoples of Austria-Hungary were the closest in economic and social status to African Americans in the U.S. This underscored a comparison of the social situation in Europe to that in the United States. Just as Americans had prejudices about Europeans, the latter had prejudices about Americans, particularly relating to America's relatively recent slave-holding past. Many reformers discouraged emigration to the United States by arguing that Slavs would be used to replace African Americans as an agricultural labor force in the Southern states. They invoked the recent history of the U.S. by asserting that immigrants would be treated as slaves. Such degrading labor would be perceived as a national insult to their European countries of origin. Authorities also feared the exploitation and Americanization of emigrants from their countries, believing they would return with their sense of collectivism and traditional morality corrupted. Meanwhile, men feared the dissolution of the patriarchy, as divorce licenses were easier to obtain in the U.S./

As a measure to prevent the possible exploitation, degradation, and Americanization of emigrants from its territories, the Austro-Hungarian government encouraged immigration to the "colonies" in Brazil, Madagascar, and Argentina. The idea was that this would allow Austria, which had been a latecomer to the colonization race, an opportunity to expand its economic reach, while allowing immigrants to enjoy the culture of their homeland. Zahra includes the early Zionist efforts to colonize Palestine in this category. However, the promotion of these colonies proved to be fruitless as North America remained the primary destination of Austro-Hungarian migrants. (65-104)

Following World War I, new nations, such as Czechoslovakia, Yugoslavia, and the Second Polish Republic emerged out of the territory that had comprised the Austro-Hungarian, Russian, and German empires. These nations sought to strengthen the ethnic homogeneity of their populations by restricting the emigration of the respective dominant ethnic groups from their lands. They simultaneously sought to encourage the emigration of populations they deemed undesirable, particularly their Jewish populations. Zahra points out that many anti-Semitic policies in Eastern European nations, such as those in Poland, Romania, and Hungary, preceded World War II. Nations like Romania and Hungary were complicit in the atrocities of the Holocaust because they corresponded with their own plans for the removal of Jews. (105-142)

Throughout the 1930s, many European governments as well as many European Jews were in agreement that Jews should emigrate from Europe. While U.S. President Franklin D. Roosevelt was sympathetic to the plight of the Jews,

he acquiesced to popular opinion in the United States and did not alter the quotas imposed in the highly restrictive 1924 Immigration Act. This attitude led to many proposed schemes to settle Jews in remote locations, such as Madagascar and British Guinea. A group of Jews did settle in the Dominican Republic under the leadership of dictator Rafael Trujillo, who was eager to bring white workers into his country. Zahra argues that these schemes were inherently discriminatory, as the people chosen for them were usually only the young and able-bodied. (143-179)

World War II displaced millions of persons, ranging from prisoners of war to concentration camp survivors. Rather than experiencing freedom of movement after the war, these individuals were subjected to restrictions due to many factors. Social workers and international organizations tended to provide vocational training for displaced people. Many of the Holocaust survivors had missed out on educational opportunities and wished to obtain college degrees, especially since many countries only accepted them based on their ability to provide skilled labor. Furthermore, many who had been taken as prisoners of war from the East wished to remain in the West, particularly Soviet prisoners of war who faced accusations of treason upon their return. These displaced persons were often forcibly repatriated. (181-215)

During the Cold War, Eastern-bloc countries halted emigration out of the need to maintain a workforce to rebuild their war-ravaged societies. The authorities expanded on the rhetoric of earlier regimes that to travel to the capitalist West would mean becoming a wage slave while to stay in one's socialist home country would mean freedom from hunger. Zahra points to the irony of this statement, using the restrictive symbol of the Berlin Wall as the prime example of how unfree the restriction of movement truly was. She does not absolve the United States from this restriction, noting that Congress, in the early 1950s, Congress passed laws restricting the immigration of anyone who had ever identified as a communist. (217-253)

Zahra argues that the period between 1989 and 2015, between the end of the Cold War and the recent resurgence of nationalism, may have been a unique time in European history due to the relative freedom of movement in Europe. She does not discount the cultural and economic tension that freedom of movement produces, but argues that its net effect is positive. (254-291) The paperback edition, published in 2017, contains an epilogue in which Zahra openly states her concern over the rise of populist anti-immigrant governments in Poland, Hungary, and the U.S. She points to the irony of xenophobia in Eastern Europe as a region that has often been harmed by such sentiments. Zahra concludes by stating her desire for readers to look at their own immigration histories for perspectives on current events. She argues that restrictions on movement inhibit freedom on both sides of borders. (292-301)

The Great Departure is compelling and relevant. Each chapter blends an analysis of official policies with stories of individuals that illustrate the diversity

of migration experiences. However, some of the early chapters are overloaded with information, obfuscating the themes of these chapters. A looseness in chronological organization also characterizes these early chapters and may put off casual readers. However, the powerful anecdotes make the work accessible to readers looking for a connection to their own ancestral immigration history. The main themes of freedom of movement and the factors that compel people to emigrate are thoroughly explored as the work progresses. Zahra neatly ties up the book with a reflection on the relevance of immigration histories to today's political climate. Given the resurgence of anti-immigrant rhetoric in recent years, it is hard to dispute the importance of this work. *The Great Departure* is essential for students of immigration and anyone seeking historical antecedents to the current immigration situation.

ABOUT THE REVIEWER: *Timothy Joseph Mancillas of Whittier, California, earned his B.A. in History with an emphasis on the Americas and Africa at the University of California, Santa Cruz (2017). He is currently pursuing an M.A in history at California State University, Fullerton (CSUF).*